

2016

## Multilingual writers' unintentional plagiarism: action research in college composition

Jacqueline D. Gullon  
*Eastern Washington University*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://dc.ewu.edu/theses>

---

### Recommended Citation

Gullon, Jacqueline D., "Multilingual writers' unintentional plagiarism: action research in college composition" (2016). *EWU Masters Thesis Collection*. 350.  
<https://dc.ewu.edu/theses/350>

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Student Research and Creative Works at EWU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in EWU Masters Thesis Collection by an authorized administrator of EWU Digital Commons. For more information, please contact [jotto@ewu.edu](mailto:jotto@ewu.edu).

---

Multilingual Writers' Unintentional Plagiarism:

Action Research in College Composition

Presented to Eastern Washington University

Cheney, Washington

---

A Thesis presented

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree

Master of Arts: English

With an Emphasis in

Teaching English as a Second Language

---

By

Jacqueline D. Gullon

Spring 2016

## Master's Thesis

In presenting the thesis in partial fulfillment of the requirement for a master's degree at Eastern Washington University, I agree that JFK Library shall make copies freely available for inspection. I further agree that copying of this project in whole or in part is allowable only for scholarly purposes. It is understood, however, that any copying or publication of the thesis for commercial purposes, or for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission.

Signature \_\_\_\_\_

Date \_\_\_\_\_

### **Abstract**

This study investigates the awareness of plagiarism and MLA citations among multilingual college students. It is an example of action research that began Fall Quarter 2013. The study conducted at Eastern Washington University in an English Composition for Multilingual Writers class involved students from Japan, Saudi Arabia, France, Germany, Spain, and China. The researcher used journal prompts to identify multi-lingual students' perception of plagiarism. The class had been designed to prepare the students for Standard American English composition writing. Students were given reading material and asked to cite and to paraphrase sentences and paragraphs. The data was analyzed, and the raters identified five categories of unintentional plagiarism. The results suggest that students, regardless of their academic and cultural history, need maximum opportunities to practice paraphrasing, summarizing, and citing sources all to prevent unintentional plagiarism.

## **Dedication**

This thesis is dedicated to my mother, Michele J. Gullon, whose teaching personality I have inherited.

## **Acknowledgements**

Thank you, Dr. LaVona Reeves, for helping me through my writer's block, and for helping me identify the "grey areas" in life. Thank you, Dr. Tracey McHenry, for your help and input. Thank you, Andrea Eickholt, for supporting me in this endeavor. Your insight is greatly appreciated. Thank you to the English 112 students who were a part of this thesis.

## **Preface**

### **Before Coming to EWU**

My mother has always done her best to help me understand who my grandfather was and where he and his family came from. His family was from Northern Spain. They were Catalan and part of a French bloodline. Because of this, Mom grew up with a very strong interest in French language and culture. This interest of hers transferred to me, so when I needed to learn a language to fulfill college credit requirements I chose French.

I received good grades in French at Spokane Falls Community College (SFCC) and Eastern Washington University (EWU), but I never at any time felt that I was learning the language to a degree of fluency. Although I minored in French and went to Nice, France to study the language for four weeks, the only success I gained was the ability to understand written French occasionally and to speak French brokenly. I do not understand spoken French very well, and lately my understanding of French has diminished since I do not have a way to practice French needed to maintain skills.

The burden of my language learning stems from timidity. I have always been timid when it comes to speaking to be heard so it is no surprise that learning to speak French was a challenge often ignored. I sat in the back of classrooms and avoided eye contact with French teachers. It was easier for me to write French because writing gave me extra time to visualize words to use. Visualizing words and then trying to say them was hard, and I would get embarrassed by how long it

took me to get two words, let alone one, out. The only reason I minored in French was because I actually enjoyed learning the language, and because of my French heritage, I felt pulled into it.

My discouraging timidity that kept me from speaking French and the inability to understand spoken French brought me to a decision on how to receive a good grade in Nice. I did not skip any classes while I was there, and I sat next to a fellow classmate (much to his dismay) who was very good at understanding our teacher. From him, I received English translations of all the homework we were expected to do. I scored the highest in reading and writing, and the lowest in speaking and listening, but I had received an A! I felt proud of my French language learning experience even on the days that the teacher giggled at me because she knew that I was lost in our conversation. My classmates giggled along with her and I was proud of that too.

### **Pre-M.A. Teaching Experience in the U.S. and Abroad**

Before I entered into the TESL program at EWU, I did not have any academic teaching experience. The only teaching I had ever done were the few times I was asked by my many dance instructors and one Karate Sensei to help with their instructions with other students. These moments were few and far between, but I came to realize that I had a gift for explaining instructions. I was given the opportunity to watch students and calculate how they were moving. I



would inform them of their mistakes and show them how to fix their movements so that they could mirror the teacher's movements more accurately.

My ability to teach dance and karate was sufficient, and I would often hear my teachers tell me that the students were doing better since I had spoken with them. The challenges I encountered were often small moments of anxiety from myself based on my natural timidity. I was always worried that I was coming across as too aggressive. This fear has aided me in remaining calm when I need to give advice to students.

I learned to implement this silent strength in Karate. My Sensei did not like laughter in his Do-Ja. I was put on laughter duty several times. I had to tell the students that they needed to quit laughing. This was a very difficult thing for me to do, and the students were not happy with me for scolding them. Culturally, the lack of laughter in the Do-Ja made complete sense. In Goju-Ryu Karate, it is important to remain focused. Laughter is considered the opposite of focus and it is also a sign of nervousness and weakness. Our Sensei was making sure that we remained centered and took ourselves and the lessons seriously. Mistakes were inevitable, but they were also nothing to be laughed at.

I, myself, had a hard time keeping to the no-laughter policy. It is difficult to not laugh when you accidentally slap your partner in the face. It is difficult to not laugh or smile when you are practicing a back kick, throw yourself off balance, and fall suddenly to the ground. It is difficult to not laugh when your

partner, excited by the push and pull of sparing, passes gas. It is difficult to not laugh.

### **During the M.A. Program**

I did not do very much language learning while I was in the TESL program. However, I do consider learning English grammar as a language learning experience. I was glad to take the class Grammar for Teachers because I did not know how to teach grammar to non-native speakers. In fact, I had had little grammar education growing up. So much of what I learned in Grammar for Teachers was new to me.

The linguistics class I took informed me that if people wish to become fluent in a new language, then they must listen to the language for at least eight hours every day. I saw this as a huge disappointment, for I still wanted to become fluent in French. I began watching as many French movies as I could on Netflix to compensate for the lack of French language in my life. I still do this now and then when I have time.

It was during the TESL program that I was able to dive into teaching. My first experiences were with Dr. Reeves, interning in her classes. The first class I interned for was English 112. In this class, I met Huda Alrasheed, whom I would later come to consider one of my closest friends. Huda and I were quite different in the way we approached teaching. Huda was very polite and unassuming. I, on the other hand, was a bit more aggressive—echoing the attitude I had adopted in

my Karate classes. Huda and I seemed to work well together, and I often joked that we were “Good Cop” and “Bad Cop.” When Huda gave a lesson, I would walk around and make sure the students were listening to her and doing the work.

When I gave a lesson, I was faced with a difficult challenge: class management. I was in a position where I had to be in front of the class and get the students to acknowledge my presence. It was not easy for me. My voice seemed too soft to reach all the students. It took time and practice. I had to remind myself that if my voice seemed loud to my ears it was still not loud enough. I also had to explain directions, read prompts, and encourage the students to begin working. I felt too young and too inexperienced, and I began to believe that the students felt that too. I would get frustrated with my insecurities. I would frown and cross my arms.

Volunteering at Asia University America Program (AUAP), where I now teach fulltime, helped me to overcome the insecurities I had working with students. As a volunteer, I could be a teacher’s assistant and a peer at the same time. I was able to sit one-on-one with students and engage in conversations with them. Sometimes, the teachers of AUAP would ask me to demonstrate lessons in front of the class. I found myself stepping in front of the students as mentor rather than a “Bad Cop.”

I volunteered frequently for AUAP. I watched the teachers and I watched my teachers, how they taught in front of the classrooms, how they spoke with students outside the classrooms, and how they balanced discipline with

compassion. I analyzed myself as a student, my weaknesses and my strengths. I had a passion for learning but I'd get tired easily, and this fatigue would lead to insecurities, which would then lead to procrastination.

In the last quarter of the TESL program, I interned for Dr. Reeves' Women's Literature class. Dr. Reeves asked me to collect homework, grade classwork, take attendance, and teach a few lectures. I also had to do the work as a student as well. I enjoyed this experience immensely. I was able to be a student and a teacher at the same time, which only furthered my understanding of the kind of teacher I envisioned myself to be.

### **Cross-Cultural Experience during MA-TESL**

The time I spent in the TESL program brought me close to Huda Alrasheed. It was clear to me from the beginning that Huda and I could be friends. We began that first quarter working together in English 112 with Dr. Reeves. Our conversations outside of class grew longer and more frequent. Eventually, we began grabbing coffee, meeting before class, and visiting each other's homes.

Huda is from Saudi Arabia and is a practicing Muslim. The closer we became as friends the more I was able to see inside of her world not just as an international student in America, but also as an individual. We talked a lot about the differences and similarities of our cultures and we even talked about religion and how easy it is to misunderstand a person's beliefs and practices.

The most intense cross-cultural experience I encountered with Huda was the night she invited me to a celebration. A friend of hers wanted to throw a birthday party for her daughter. I was greeted at the door by Huda and about fourteen other Saudi women. They were not wearing Abaya's or covering their faces. They were wearing dresses, jeans, t-shirts, blouses, pumps, bare feet, socks, make-up, and hairspray. They spoke loudly in thick and light tones, the Arabic whisking around me in a haze. Some were very polite and spoke broken English to welcome me into the apartment. Others whispered to each other and motioned towards the option of food that I had brought.

I followed them into the living room where all sorts of children from all sorts of ages under nine ran amuck. They threw themselves at my knees and insisted on knowing who I was, why I was there, and who had invited me. The children, I should add, were almost completely fluent in English, more fluent than their respective mothers. I had long blonde hair at that time, so much to my amusement, was considered Elsa from the Disney movie, *Frozen*.

We ate dinner on the floor. We sat in a circle next to the thin sheet of plastic that had been laid down to protect the dishes and bowls from the carpet. The food filled the inner circle. Most of the options to eat were a type of casserole. The women would inform each other of who brought what, and I knew that there was some sort of etiquette that I needed to attend to. I tried to eat as much as I could. My nervous stomach would not allow me to eat as much as I probably should have to show respect as a guest, and I ended up going home with

plates of food, the women insisting that if I wasn't hungry, then my mother at home would be.

We danced a lot with each other and with the children to American pop music and occasionally Arabic pop music. We drank a lot of Arabic coffee. Practicing Muslims do not drink alcohol, so the drugs of choice were caffeine and sugar from the birthday cake. I was up until four A.M. that night. I went home exhausted, fat, and happy.

### **Teaching Philosophy**

I believe it is easier for a person to learn a new language if they are interested in the outcome of learning that language. For example, I enjoyed learning French because the outcome for me was the feeling of being connected to my ancestry. In my experience teaching, I have noticed that it can be harder for students to learn a language if they are not able to see the rewards the new language offers them. If students cannot find a connection between themselves and the second language, or the culture from which the second language derives, the student's identity and sense of self are unable to motivate learning. The student closes him or herself off from the learning experience and learning the language becomes an answer to the question, *why?*

Motivation is considered key in these types of situations where students cannot find a reason within themselves to continue their studies. I adhere to the whole language approach to learning. Treating the class as a kind of book club

where students can discuss elements of life through their second language can broaden the students' views and cultivate motivation. Where the students may not have had a voice in their first language, the second language could offer opportunities for discussions and expression of opinions.

All of the experiences I have had being a student, volunteering, interning, and finally teaching, have allowed me to recognize four important traits that I recognize in teachers: patience, flexibility, humility, and joy. It is not surprising that I encourage humor in the classroom. Humor has the ability to reduce stress and heighten retention of course content.

Besides being open to laughter, the most important quality of teaching is the ability to change how something is taught. Students have more opportunities to learn when I am flexible in my approach. I would like to consider all the teaching I do as action

## **Table of Contents**

1. Introduction
2. Methods and Research
3. Review of Literature
4. Data Analysis
5. Reflection and Conclusion



## **Chapter 1**

### **Introduction**

“You can’t steal an idea. Nobody owns an idea.”

Ming-

Hua from China

Fall quarter in 2012 at Eastern Washington University (EWU), I was an intern for English 112 Composition for Multi-lingual Writers, a prerequisite to English 101. Peter Lacey, my peer and thesis writer, was conducting research in which students were asked to translate poems from their own language into English in a Friday essay. He collected these essays and reported that a Chinese student corrected a mistake she found in her copy of one of the Chinese poems to be translated in class in 50 minutes that day:

Writer 17 is a native Chinese speaker. She was asked to translate a Tang Dynasty poem by Meng Jiao. Although the researchers were unaware prior to giving her the assignment, Writer 17 had studied the poem during her education in China and was, apparently, very familiar with the Chinese version. This was made clear when she alerted the class instructor that the copy of the poem she received was missing the final line. She asked whether she should fill in the missing L1 words, and the instructor agreed that it was the best course of action to allow her to do a complete translation into the TL. Accordingly, Writer 17 filled in the final L1 line from memory and then created a complete L1 translation. (Lacey, p. 68, 2013)

In other words, the Chinese student knew the poem so well that it became a part of her sense of self. In some ways, she could have been demonstrating a

collective consciousness of Chinese who go back for many generations. Shih-Chieh Chien says, “Copying classic texts—for example, by reciting forefathers’ words constantly—is a way of showing respect and knowledge, and this educational culture is ingrained in the modern era” (p. 131, 2014). Writer 17 had demonstrated what her Chinese education had taught her. Writer 17 says in her essay:

I think everyone should learn this poem. Actually they [do], because this poem is in our text book in elementary school. So every [kid has] to learn it. (Lacey, p. 69, 2013)

Every Chinese student learns this poem in elementary school. It becomes a part of the children’s upbringing much like the Pledge of Allegiance in the United States. The Pledge of Allegiance is a predominant childhood memory to most Americans that connects children to their culture and to their nationality. In his discussion on Writer 17, Lacey writes:

Her explanations also reveal that the language of commonly read poetry is often quite different from the language spoken in contemporary society. Like some of the Japanese writers’ essays, her essay establishes a link between the past and present of her culture. (Lacey, p. 81, 2013)

Although the language used in the poetry is not the same language the students speak, it is important in Chinese culture for the students to learn these poems. The poems allow the students to connect psychologically to Chinese ancestry and culture.

During this time in English 112, Dr. Reeves, lecturer and thesis director, asked me to supervise a group of four students, (two Japanese and two Saudi) who were presenting a chapter in the primary text, *Eleanor Roosevelt: A Life of Discovery*, a Newbury Award nominee, by Russell Freedman (1993). For the assignment, the students would complete an outline script for their presentation. When the students emailed me their outlines, I discovered they had copied sentences from Freedman's book. I placed quotation marks and page numbers where needed. The next day I showed the students the corrections and taught them how to reference source material. The second draft of their outline was similar to their first draft for they had not made the changes requested for their final outlines. I began to consider Eastern Washington University's student conduct code:

Violations of academic integrity involve the use or attempted use of any method or technique enabling a student to misrepresent the quality or integrity of any of his or her work in the university and the program of study. (EWU, 2016, web)

I became intrigued with the idea that some English learners might not know how to reference or might not consider it important. Further, I learned from a friend that some foreign students would pay their American friends to do their homework for them. I realized that EWU's foreign student body was not being taught ethical academic behavior successfully and that some of the students did not know about the school policy or how to follow it.

Dr. Reeves helped me to see that my attitude toward the research was potentially biased and that it would have to be disclosed and addressed directly in the thesis, as

required by our international professional organization Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages (TESOL). Dr. Reeves asked, “What are the gray areas [of plagiarism]?” Jessica Reyman uses the phrase “grey areas” in her article “Rethinking Plagiarism in Technical Communication.” Reyman says:

We need to help students to distinguish between intellectual “theft” and common and ethical composing practices in the workplace by talking more explicitly about the gray areas that exist between original composition, copying, and reusing texts in professional contexts. (Reyman, p. 62, 2008).

Reyman explains that students should be able to see the differences between what is written by the source and what is appropriated by them in their written work. Although Reyman is writing about plagiarism for technical communication settings, her use of the phrase “grey areas” is similar to how Dr. Reeves uses the term. They both are acknowledging causes behind plagiarism that might be misunderstood, overlooked, or unidentified. The “grey areas” of plagiarism are not black (wrong) or white (right).

This thesis focuses on literature that *defines* intentional and unintentional plagiarism through a lens of openness and awareness of all academic cultures. bell hooks calls this “radical openness” (p. 206, 1989) in “Choosing the Margin as a Space of Radical Openness.” The margin is seen as a “space” by hooks to perceive possibilities that might be overlooked or misunderstood (hooks, 1989). Based on the marginality subjected to oppressed minorities, “radical openness” is “resistance” against the majority (hooks, p. 206, 1989). In this “space”, one can be more aware of how culture affects

writing and how individuals' backgrounds inspire their writing voices. The CCCC express bell hook's radical openness in the following statement:

The CCCC Statement on Second Language Writing and Writers calls on us 'to recognize the regular presence of second-language writers in writing classes, to understand their characteristics, and to develop instructional and administrative practices that are sensitive to their linguistic and cultural needs'. (CCCC, 2016,web)

The composition classroom should be an environment open to the new perceptions on writing brought in by foreign students. Teachers might need to learn about their students' cultural perceptions of writing in order to teach new skills such as referencing, paraphrasing, and summarizing source materials. In the space of radical openness, this thesis perceives that written work is taught differently in other countries, and therefore, plagiarism may be defined differently by each.

### **Significance of the Study**

The goal of this thesis is to identify grey areas that connect the good and bad dichotomies of plagiarism and uncover subtle issues that might be cultural. The intentional side of plagiarism is blatant disregard for referencing authors whose words are purposefully used by students to pass a class or earn a higher grade. The unintentional side of plagiarism is considered to be honest mistakes in referencing, citing, paraphrasing, and summarizing that are the result of inefficient learning of MLA and low

English proficiency. Also, unintentional plagiarism, perceived through a Western lens, could be considered a result of the aforementioned rote memorization or differences in students' previous education.

### **Statement of the Problem**

#### *Teachers' Perceptions and the TurnItIn Program*

Students conduct research through the use of ideas from other sources. They are considered educated if they can merge several authors' ideas into one main conclusion (McBride, p. 2, 2008). MLA and APA citation is used to indicate original and unoriginal writing. Consider EWU's definition of plagiarism:

...the presentation of submission of the work of another, without citation or credits, as your own work. It is a criminal act – whether intentional or by accident. (EWU, 1016, web)

Problems occur when students are unable to give proper citation, and they are charged with plagiarism. Plagiarizing allegations can be detrimental to students if they are perceived to have violated student conduct codes, and they could be disciplined by the university, expelled, and/or deported as acknowledged further in EWU's policy:

Three sanctioned instances of a violation of academic integrity during a student's enrollment at Eastern Washington University will constitute grounds for an immediate sanction of dismissal from the university. (EWU, 2016, web)

ESL students are learning how to synthesize literature while they are still learning English. They may be learning these writing formats for the first time. In many cultures,

the use of an author's words without giving credit to the author is a natural practice within their discourse communities (Hu & Lei, 2012). Since a student could be asked to leave EWU after found violating academic integrity three times, it is important that teachers understand students' cultural perspectives and that ESL students are taught the EWU academic integrity policy when they enter the university.

Sutherland-Smith (2010) suggests that teachers tend to focus more on students complying with academic integrity policies. The criminal offense of plagiarism becomes more important than teaching students skills needed to prevent plagiarism. When teachers react to plagiarism in this manner, they become cops rather than facilitators. Consider the program TurnItIn, which runs essays through search engines to find work that was previously written. This program is not always correct with its findings, but teachers are required to respond to any situation involving essays that have high percentages of copied material according to the program. TurnItIn exacerbates the criminal nuances of copied material because it does not identify mistakes but rather errors. It depends on teachers' motivation to look at the essay critically and judge whether or not the plagiarism is intentional. The following is taken from the CCCC website as a reminder to consider the importance of having an understanding of unintentional plagiarism:

Given the high stakes nature of many of these assessment purposes, it is crucial that assessment practices be guided by sound principles to insure that they are valid, fair, and appropriate to the context and purposes for which they [are] designed. (CCCC, 2016, web)

One can consider the “high stakes nature” as a violation of conduct codes that lead to expulsion from the university. Therefore, lessons using references should be “valid, fair, and appropriate.” This means that all variables within the environment should be considered.

Rebecca Howard Moore explains in her article, “*Plagiarisms, Authorships, and the Death Penalty*,” (1995) that there are examples of plagiarism that could be redefined as stages within the process of learning how to write. For example, “patchwriting” (Howard, 1995, p. 788) is defined by Howard as: “‘copying from a source text and then deleting some words, altering grammatical structures, or plugging in one-for-one synonym-substitutes’ (Howard 233) .” Patchwriting describes stages in learning how to paraphrase.

Kelly McBride says that “‘Patchwriting’ is more common than plagiarism, just as dishonest” (McBride, 2012). A journalist working for *The New York Times* was fired when it was discovered that her report on Frank Lloyd Wright had a similar structure to that of an article written before hers. She had not only crafted similar sentences, but also used some of the same words to describe Wright’s paintings that the original author had used. It was assumed by her employer that this was intentional.

McBride writes that “rearranging without citation” is something journalists do (2012, p. 4). She stresses that in “the market place of ideas...material is absent any original reporting and instead built upon the work of others.” The more that is written about any given subject, the more it becomes



“accepted as truth.” McBride’s advice to journalists on patch writing is to avoid “repurposed” (p. 5) material and strive to write material “that brings new value to the audience” (2012, p. 4).

Oliver Sacks introduces “cyptomnesia” (2013, p. 5) to the literature on plagiarism. “Cryptomnesia” is defined by Oxford as “occurs when a forgotten memory returns without it being recognized as such by the subject, who believes it is something new and original” (2015, web). Sacks spoke about the accusations of plagiarism Hellen Keller received when she was twelve years old. Her story, “The Frost King”, was compared to Margaret Canby’s “The Frost Fairies.” Keller, who did not remember Canby’s story, was not charged of plagiarism by Canby. Instead, Canby was impressed by Helen Keller’s memory (Sacks). Perhaps the term “cryptomnesia” needs to be better known, for though one may speak of “unconscious plagiarism,” the very word “plagiarism” is so morally charged, so suggestive of crime and deceit, that it remains a sting even if it is “unconscious” (Sack, 2013, p. 5).

### **Assumptions**

The following is a list of the assumptions investigated upon the beginning of the research into intentional and unintentional plagiarism among ESL students.

1. ESL college students in the United States come from different academic backgrounds which reflect ideas of ownership of words that may be different from those in the United States.

2. Multilingual writers, upon entering the university, have varying ideas of the meaning of plagiarism.
3. Academic integrity can and should be taught in the college writing class, regardless of writers' backgrounds.
4. Creating materials in which writers apply their knowledge of how to ethically cite sources will help writers remember how to do this on their own.
5. Such practice will increase their confidence as research writers.
6. Writing instructors need guidance about how to approach the subject with multilingual writers and how to demonstrate cultural competence within this complex area.

### **Research Questions**

The research questions that emerged from discussions with the thesis chair follow.

1. In what ways do ESL students plagiarize—both intentionally and unintentionally—when they write for academic purposes?
2. What are some cultural perceptions of plagiarism?
3. What can teachers do to help ESL students understand and avoid plagiarism?

The literature examines the cultural academic differences between Eastern and Western practices as well as ways to teach citation skills for both ESL and native writers of English in the United States. Looking at this research, one can identify the

pedagogical problems that already exist within the teachings of academic integrity as well as cultural differences in what is considered common knowledge.

The following literature introduces some of the main issues regarding plagiarism found in both multilingual and American writers' essays. While culture plays a significant role in the process of ESL students' language learning acquisition, other aspects such as problematic teacher/student relations add to the misunderstandings students have about plagiarism. Different definitions of plagiarism and the confusion caused by intertextuality and common cultural knowledge continues to contribute to students' understanding of ownership, regardless of their background.

### **Overview of the Thesis**

Chapter 2 is a review of the literature about (1) the affective humanistic approach to language teaching, (2) multilingual writers' challenges, (3) ownership of words and cultural texts, (4) unintentional plagiarism and patch writing, and (5) intentional plagiarism and technology. Chapter 3 is the action research case study and analysis of the questionnaire and multilingual writers' essays. Chapter 4 is the discussion of and reflection of the findings. Chapter 5 is the conclusion.

## Chapter 2

### Literature Review

Chapter 2 is a review of the literature about (1) the affective humanistic approach to language teaching, (2) multilingual writers' challenges, (3) ownership of words and cultural texts, (4) unintentional plagiarism and patchwriting, and (5) intentional plagiarism and technology.

#### Four Current Approaches to Language Teaching

In *Teaching English as a Second or Foreign Language* (2014), Marianne Celce-Murcia introduces the four approaches that are considered best practices currently in The United States for teaching multilingual students—regardless of the age or level of the learners. Table 1 is a summary of these four approaches.

Table 1. Central Principles of Four Current Approaches to Language Teaching

---

Approach	Central Principle
Cognitive Approach	Language learning is rule-governed cognitive behavior (not habit formation).
Affective-humanistic approach	Learning a foreign language is a process of self-realization and of relating to other people.
Comprehension approach	

	Language acquisition occurs if
	and only if the learner receives and
Communicative approach	comprehends sufficient meaningful
	input.

The purpose of language (and thus the goal of language teaching and learning) is communication.

(Celce-Murcia, 2014, p. 9)

The four approaches in the table have been “widely used during the final quarter of the twentieth century” (Celce-Murcia, 2014, p. 7) and have continued to grow in the first two decades of the 21<sup>st</sup> century. In the cognitive approach, professionals strive to teach multilingual writers basic strategies that they can remember and use as needed for specific purposes. One of the features is “individualized [instruction]” (p. 7) because individuals learn differently, and the focus is on meaningful learning of the language based on current cognitive psychology and not on a behaviorist view of language acquisition as “habit formation” (p. 7). In this approach, the instructor naturally differentiates instruction for different kinds of learners and may offer choices to learners (Tompkins, 2013, p. 292).

Next, the affective-humanistic approach treats the classroom as a community. For example, Celce-Murcia says that “the class atmosphere is more important than materials or methods” (p. 7). A close community is treated as essential to helping multilingual students learn through a “self-realization process” (p. 8). In other words, based on Charles Curran’s philosophy and that of Carl Rogers, the teacher creates a community in which learners grow through personal interactions with others, the texts, and the media that support the learning. Hallmarks of this approach include the following.

- Respect for each individual (students and teachers) and for [his or her] feelings is emphasized.
- Communication that is personally meaningful to the learner is given priority.
- Instruction involves much work in pairs and small groups.
- The class atmosphere is viewed as more important than materials or methods.
- Peer support and interaction are viewed as necessary for learning.
- Learning a second or foreign language is viewed as a self-realization process.
- The teacher is a counselor or facilitator.... (p. 7-8)

Next, the comprehension-based approach does not consider explicit or rote “rule learning” (Celce-Murcia, 2014, p. 8) an essential part of language learning, and “error correction” is not stressed. Importance is placed on the communicative

abilities of the student, and it is not vital that their language is error-free. In other words, learners will demonstrate their understanding of concepts in indirect ways through communication, not always on a test.

Finally, the communicative approach is integral to the teaching of multilingual writers because the focus is on conveying the writers' meaning to others without being overly concerned about the correctness of the mechanics or MLA style in early drafts of writing. The editing occurs later in this approach which Celce-Murcia summarizes here.

- It is assumed that the content of a language course will include semantic notions and social functions and that they are as important as linguistic structures....

- Classroom materials and activities often consist of authentic tasks and projects presented and practiced using segments of preexisting meaningful discourse, not materials primarily constructed for pedagogical purposes.

- Skills are integrated from the beginning; a given activity might involve reading, speaking, listening, and also writing... (p. 8)

The roles of reflective teaching require teachers to analyze the steps they take during teaching and when away from teaching. Self-awareness is key. Teachers are able to change their teaching strategies based on past, present, and future experiences. Three character traits are listed by J. M. Murphy (2014):

“open-mindedness, responsibility, and wholeheartedness” (Celce-Murcia, 2014, p. 615). Teachers aspire to have these character traits when using reflective teaching.

### **Intentional Plagiarism and Technology**

According to Wendy Sutherland-Smith, in her article “Retribution, deterrence and reform: the dilemmas of plagiarism management in universities,” preventing plagiarism starts with the teachers (Sutherland-Smith, 2010). Since technology has given birth to cutting and pasting strategies (Ellery, 2008a) and the use of someone else’s words is deemed offensive depending on the goal of the strategy (Anson, 2011), it is important to help students learn proper referencing skills (Pittam et al, 2009; Sutherland-Smith, 2010). Cultural perceptions of referencing and citing should also be talked about in ESL and EFL classrooms so that students will be able to understand differences between the two cultures (Hu & Lei, 2012). Helping native students and non-native students find their authorial voice could benefit those who might feel their referencing skills are inadequate (Pittam et al, 2009). Preventing intentional and non-intentional plagiarism extends to students who are native speakers.

Plagiarism can be done through the use of texts, videos, pictures, and ideas that are not given due citation. Professors are equipped with computer databases that find plagiarism within students’ writing, but even this technology does not find plagiarism successfully (Alzahrani). Students can steal the ideas of an author without computerized detection of these instances (Alzahrani). While technology



can identify students' plagiarizing in software such as Turnitin, technology also contributes to the problem of plagiarism. Ellery (2008a) states that the more technology has come into play in academics, the more students plagiarize through the cutting and pasting method. Another problem stems from websites that do not give authorship to their articles (McBride, 2013). With the many electronic sources available to students and with inconsistent and/or no citations given within these sources, Ellery (2008b) claims that many students do not actually know how to properly cite such sources, especially electronic artifacts—both media-based and print-based.

The cutting and pasting method can also be used as a “boilerplate” (Anson, 2011, p. 33) for some companies and institutions. Different professions harbor various definitions of plagiarism. Some of their practices use plagiarism as a strategy to get work done quickly (Anson, 2011). In Anson's research, some sharing of authorship is done to save time. Examples of this can be seen by businesses that use “boilerplate” material—something that has been created and shared among companies, which is copied and pasted throughout different published documents. The difference between this practice of plagiarism, and what is believed to be true in academics, is the plagiarized material's goal (Anson). If it is used within a company or institution that shares these documents often, then it is not deemed as an offense. However, in academics and research, authors are creating “professional identities” (Anson, p. 36) that they must have as their own.

The use of technology and the Internet further enables plagiarism as the copy/paste method offers an easy solution to academic writing. Plagiarism in composition classes has become a very serious matter since it is easy for students to do their research, use the copy/paste method, or buy papers off the Internet. The Internet is open to the public, and many websites do not show the names of their authors. Students can be tempted by the easy access of the Internet to find written material that can be copied and pasted. These Internet temptations are worsened by websites such as, *writemypapers.org* that promise students a paper written on any given subject and mailed to them before the deadline. This website announces that papers written by its employees will be scanned through plagiarism detection software. On the front page, one of the website's bulletins reads: "Writing a paper will not ever be a problem for you if you resort to our custom writing service—we can truly make your academic life easier" (2013). In other words, this company claims to be able to circumvent TurnItIn or other software teachers use to identify plagiarized papers or content. These modern world temptations give students an easy out from their school responsibilities when they suffer from the inability or fear to use their own words.

### **Ownership of Words and Cultural Texts**

Speaking of Taiwanese students, Shih-Ming Lo says in her thesis, *Cultural Influences and Issues for Taiwanese Students Learning English as a Foreign Language* that using imitation to learn English can be worthwhile practice that

can lead towards original work (Lo, 1996, p. 35). The students can transform their writing habits from their cultural standpoint to a Westernized standpoint. The teacher can facilitate these procedures through doing assignments with the students (p. 35, 36). Watching teachers use references and quotations in their writing might guide students to a better understanding. Lo calls this “a slow process away from plagiarism, past imitation, and toward creativity” (p. 35). This process needs teachers to break down lessons on plagiarism and allow students to make many mistakes as a part of the learning process.

Anson suggests helping students see cultural differences in order for them to understand that they are a part of an institution that does not view the sharing of information without due credit as a respectful strategy (p. 40) but as an affront to academia. Anson’s example shows that culturally constructed practices affect the way people treat plagiarism.

Plagiarism is perceived differently cross-culturally. In cultures such as the Middle East (McCabe et al, 2008) and Asia (Kwong et al, 2010), collectivistic societies affect the notions of what individualistic societies consider plagiarism (McCabe et al, 2008; Kwong, 2010; Hu & Lei, 2012; Gourlay & Deane, 2012). When students believe that their peers are breaking academic integrity codes, it is easier for them to do the same (McCabe et al.). In Kwong et al.’s (2010) research, Chinese students engaged in “collusion” (p. 346), and they were not able to identify the difference between it and “collaboration.” The pressure to do any type of plagiarizing usually stems from bad habits, such as the lack of “time

management skills” (Kwong et al). But focusing such problems on the students is not what pedagogical researchers suggest. Ellery suggests that most unintentional plagiarism happens when teachers do not take appropriate measures to teach the prevention of plagiarism in the classroom (Ellery, 2008).

Tricia Bertram Gallant’s “The Complexity of Integrity Culture Change: A Case Study of a Liberal Arts College” (2007) shows that close relations between students and teachers can cause intentional plagiarism. The research investigated the element of “integrity culture change” (Gallant, p. 392) undertaken at a Catholic university in the Midwest. The campus culture is constructed from “the values of John Baptist De La Salle [that] continue to guide the college in maintaining a low student-to-teacher ratio and in fostering close mentoring relationships between faculty and students (Gallant, 2007, p. 398). This campus culture caused the majority of those researched to resist the new honor codes established for research purposes. The goal of the new honor code was to teach students and teachers academic integrity. Plagiarism took many forms, including teachers giving their students the answers and peers sharing their papers. Teachers wanted students to feel safe so that they would be willing to communicate with them (Gallant). Adding artifacts that taught students about academic integrity caused a resistance from both the teachers and the students. The teachers were upset because their students did not feel close to them because of the new and intimidating policy (Gallant). It is not outwardly stated, but it is assumed that the teachers wanted the community to be close because of its religious affiliation.

Being close to the students may help the teachers know how the students were doing religiously.

Research on English as Second Language (ESL) and English as Foreign Language (EFL) students provide insight into what is necessary in teaching skills in paraphrasing, summarizing, and citing (Kwong, 2010; Hu & Lei, 2012). Most ESL students struggle with the interpretation of plagiarism in a Western context, since many cultures do not view the use of someone else's words as an insult to their reader or their own credibility (McCabe et al, 2008). In fact, many cultures see the use of another author's words as a sign of knowledge or intelligence.

Gallant's research, conducted in an American Catholic university, can be a useful insight into the situations in foreign countries and within our ESL or EFL classrooms. Considering culture, researchers McCabe et al. (2008) investigated Lebanese and American students on instances of academic integrity. The results showed that the Lebanese students had more instances of breaking academic integrity codes. However, McCabe argues that their collectivistic culture allows the sharing of information inside and outside of the classroom.

Westernized "discourse" (Sutherland, 2010) around using someone else's words differs from what is found in collectivistic societies. If plagiarism and other morally ambivalent practices are undertaken by students learning English and slowly becoming acculturated into Western academic practices, the question for all English teachers is whether or not policies on plagiarism or academic integrity should be changed (McCabe et al, 2008). Should Lebanese students be forced to

change their response to a nurtured culture in order to learn the Western ideals of composition writing (McCabe)? Since Gallant's research tried to change the collectivistic campus culture at the Catholic University, should cultures that break academic integrity policies change? McCabe answers this question by stating: "A better solution will probably be found by developing collectivistic-appropriate teaching strategies that emphasize and take advantage of the power of collaborative work" (2008). Mixing the blurring lines within the classroom may help students identify what is happening when unintentional plagiarism takes place.

Power (2009) identified several "themes" in her study of native English-speakers. She discovered that students who feel a loss of "agency" when it comes to writing for classes tended to plagiarize more. The "power" (Power), which was another theme, was placed with the teachers leaving students feeling as though their voices did not matter. The teachers would tell them not to plagiarize, but many of the students felt that they were not properly taught how to prevent plagiarizing unintentionally.

Another theme, Power (2009) dubbed "externalization." Since plagiarizing was a concept the teachers despised but did not teach against, the students felt that plagiarizing was a crime only if committed outside the school. One student out of 31 claimed that he/she felt that plagiarizing went against his/her morals. The students had not internalized the negative connotations to plagiarizing; therefore, they did not see it as something they should prevent themselves from doing.

Lyon (2009) discusses how writing academic papers is seen as an "institutional, ritualized act, one with effects, but more through form than through [students'] agency" (p. 231). Since students may not know how to speak their mind and do not feel that they have ownership over their work (Lyon), they may see all academic words as belonging and correct. Through this view they do not have a sense of ownership over their words because their words are controlled by the paper, the teacher, and how they must format the document (Lyon).

Handa and Power (2005) questioned East Indian undergraduates and teachers in India and East Indian post-graduates going to school in Australia. The East India teachers explained in their questionnaires that their undergraduate students were not asked to reference source materials. The post-graduates confirmed their own experience of not having to use in-text referencing until they had begun their master's degrees. The post-graduates experienced difficulties when switching to the Australian university. They learned the new rules of academic writing through their own research and. "Although some students said they had received some introduction to academic skills in the Australian context there seemed to be general agreement that it was insufficient" (Handa & Power, 2005). The students had been taught different techniques in academic writing in their home country. A student described plagiarism as using someone else's answers when taking a test, but using the exact words from textbooks as their own was a practice taught to them in India. These views on plagiarism were not created from academic dishonesty but from a different academic culture. The East Indian academic practices were very different from the Australian ideas of in-text referencing. A survey was given

to eighty undergraduate students asking them questions about plagiarism (Handa & Power, 2005). Twelve percent referenced in text and used a reference list for their papers; therefore, many of the students were writing papers and not showing where they had gleaned their information. Cultural academic practices exist around the world that do not imitate Western practices. Handa and Power's study on Asian students in Australia showed that many students were taught to give only a reference list at the end of their papers and did not have to cite sources within the text (Handa & Power).

Chien interviewed 23 composition teachers at an accredited university in Taiwan. More than half of the teachers had received their degrees from English-speaking universities around the world. Chien interviewed each of the teachers separately for an hour, questioning views of intentional and unintentional plagiarism including how they believed their students produced it and how they prevent plagiarism from happening again in the future.

Based on Chien's interviews, 76 "occurrences" of relevant discussion was about how the teachers did not agree to plagiarism whether it was intentional or not. They would punish the students by giving a lower grade and asking them to rewrite the product, or in some instances, give them a failing grade for the class or expel them from the university. The fact that Confucian backgrounds collided with Western academic schooling and caused misunderstandings when it came to the use of another author's words and the importance of citation occurred 81 times in the interviews. The way to end plagiarism among students was "to



improve students' language proficiency and teach students academic writing conventions" was mentioned 71 times in the interviews.

Some teachers acknowledged that the students had grown up in a Chinese culture where people share their accomplishments. The teachers felt they needed to use anti-plagiarism software in order to promote academic honesty. But one teacher did not like using this software, because it lacked the capacity to check all written information available through the Internet. 22 out of the 23 teachers did not believe in unintentional plagiarism. The consensus was that the students were in college and knew the citation guidelines. If they broke academic conduct rules, they would suffer consequences. One teacher viewed a distinct difference between intentional and unintentional plagiarism. She called it "simple ignorance" of referencing and citation.

Paraphrasing can help students with their comprehension (Karbalaee and Amoli, 2011). For ESL learners, difficulties of paraphrasing are hid due to a lack of vocabulary. Restating the meaning through the use of synonyms benefits the students' lexicon. Learning to paraphrase can broaden language through the use of grammar, syntax, and vocabulary. If students cannot comprehend what they are reading then meaning can be paraphrased incorrectly or taken out of context. Doing so may encourage or motivate students to perceive positive outcomes to paraphrasing.

## **Unintentional Plagiarism and Patchwriting**

Jessica Reyman explains in “Rethinking plagiarism for Technical Communication” (2008) the definitive definitions of plagiarism that might cause confusion when taught to technical communication students. To understand the confusion, Reyman explains the demands of a technical communicators in the professional setting as opposed to the classroom setting. The differences between plagiarizing and doing technical communication activities are explained by Reyman:

Technical communicators commonly perform a variety of types of composing activities that could be considered plagiarism in the context of the classroom. Such activities include:

- Using boilerplate materials and templates
- Relying on existing designs and layouts in the creation of texts
- Collaboratively creating written works
- Ghostwriting texts for popular media consumption
- Assigning the status of "honorary authorship" in published

scientific research to lab supervisor so r advisors who have contributed little to the writing process

- Cutting, pasting, and re-purposing existing content, including collating information from technical documents and product specifications
- Single sourcing.

These common workplace writing practices do not follow the current model for single-authored, original works that is the focus of much technical communication writing instruction. (Reyman, p. 61, 2008)

Reyman explains that the integrity policy regarding plagiarism is the same in technical communication classrooms as it is in all other writing classrooms; however, since the policy usually does not investigate “grey areas” (Reyman) of plagiarism, Reyman suggests that students may struggle with the inability to differentiate between the honest work of professional technical communicators and what is considered law-breaking plagiarism.

Kolln, Gray, and Salvatore mention in *Understanding English Grammar* (2016) that “we now know that recognizing diversity is key to understanding any language—diversity in speakers and diversity in the purposes for communicating” (2016, p. 7).

Gabriela M. Gillespie (2012) wrote to academic advisors for *The Mentor: An Academic Advising Journal* from Pennsylvania State University Division of Undergraduate Students about the increase in foreign students entering American universities. Gillespie acknowledges that, while the American students, might plagiarize willfully, foreign students are “most often unaware of any wrongful behavior” (Gillespie, web). Her advice to the advisors was to explain the cultural differences and the importance of academic integrity in the U.S. to students in a “direct and frank” manner. However, from further research, this black-and-white approach does work with foreign students as well as American students. The honor codes are products of an academic culture that is rife with criminalizing the misappropriation of words (Howard, 1995;

Howard, 2000). Honor codes are held in high regard, and with the intention of keeping the codes in place comes the importance of justice (Howard, 1995; Howard, 2000). The problem with this is that students, both ESL learners and native English speakers, have personal experiences with their writing that reaches into “metacognitive awareness” and lack thereof. People make mistakes; and learning how to synthesize literature, and do it correctly, is hard. Writing is a process that has many stages and in each of these stages is room for development; so learning how to use the words of another appropriately is an essential step.

Rebecca Howard Moore explains in her article “*Plagiarisms, Authorships, and the Death Penalty*” (1995) that there are examples of plagiarism that could be redefined as stages of learning. For example, “patchwriting” (Howard, 1995, pg. 788) is defined by Howard as: “‘copying from a source text and then deleting some words, altering grammatical structures, or plugging in one-for-one synonym-substitutes’ (Howard 233).” Patch writing describes stages in learning how to paraphrase.

The criminal implications of plagiarism could be in part due to the “metaphors” (Howard, 2000, p. 486) that are associated with it. Rebecca Howard writes in *Sexuality, Textuality: the Cultural Work of Plagiarism* (2000) about the violent sexual connotations surrounding plagiarism. By doing so, she first acknowledges that in many aspects of Western writing culture, the writer is considered male while the female is considered his inspiration (Howard, p. 476). The male is the creator of his prose and his pros belongs to him. The ownership over his words is the product of his “originality” (Howard, p. 477). Another author’s attempt at using the male writer’s words for his own benefit, through

the notion of ownership and originality, is akin to thievery because his words are his property (Howard).

The gender bias associated with plagiarism confuses our senses with “sex, violence, and ownership” (Howard, p. 479). Howard argues that the author is viewed as mainly “male” in Western society (Howard). The writer writes and is “inspired by his object which is female” (Howard). The words of the writer belong to the writer just as women have been viewed to belong to men (Meltzer, mentioned by Howard, p. 479). When another man takes the author’s woman, or his words, the misappropriation becomes a violent battle for ownership (Howard, p. 185). Howard says, “If we take the metaphors away, plagiarism is bereft of meaning; it becomes a transgressive speech act without consequent injury” (p. 486).

Abukhattala (2012) questioned post-graduate students in Libya about their knowledge of plagiarism. Out of this group were a number of students who were mastering in teaching English as a foreign language degree. Abukhattala’s goal was to find a connection "between plagiarism and Culture." His research found that the top four reasons behind the students’ plagiarizing were: "Lack of language proficiency; Poor understanding of plagiarism; Previous educational practices; Lack of punitive punishment." Through the "semi-structured interviews" (Abukhattala), the students expressed an extreme lack of knowledge when it came to plagiarism. They admitted to knowing about their peers plagiarizing. Some could not define plagiarism, but they did understand the concept of using another person's words as their own as wrong and even "a sin based on their religion's teachings" (Abukhattala).

Abukhattala (2012) calls for more teachings on academic integrity from teachers: "We should make our students explicitly aware of the expectations, procedures, and consequences related to plagiarism." He perceives his research as proof that culture and plagiarism are not connected. The students in the research knew of the concept of plagiarism, but their inability to recognize it proved they had not been taught properly. Indeed, some students admitted to plagiarizing because they did not think the university provided consequences. The misguided students were products of their academic environment that stemmed from a lack of sufficient academic training.

"Patchwriting" is a negative strategy that motivates students into using common phrases within an unfamiliar discourse community (Chatterjee, 2007). The students in Chatterjee's study used "patchwriting" and direct quotes to write their papers (p. 93). Chatterjee suggests that ESL students should be given many opportunities to learn how to paraphrase and summarize from the earliest part of their English studies. Otherwise, students "may be baffled by the demands for transparency and remain quasi-literate in the discursive practices of their discipline" (Chatterjee, p. 93). By "transparency", Chatterjee means that the students will not be able to relate to the need for providing sources of the information in research papers. They will be "quasi-literate", because they are not given the right tools to be a part of the research community.

Kelly McBride says that "'Patchwriting' is more common than plagiarism, just as dishonest" (McBride, 2012). A journalist working for *The New York Times* was fired when it was discovered that her report on Frank Lloyd Wright had a

similar structure to that of an article written before hers. She had not only crafted similar sentences, but also used some of the same words to describe Wright's paintings that the original author had used. It was assumed by her employer that this was intentional.

McBride writes that "rearranging without citation" is something journalists do (2012, p. 4). She stresses that in "the market place of ideas...material is absent any original reporting and instead built upon the work of others." The more that is written about any given subject, the more it becomes "accepted as truth." McBride's advice to journalists on patchwriting is to avoid "repurposed" (p. 5) material and strive to write material "that brings new value to the audience" (2012, p. 4).

In Sun's study on EFLs, a Likert scale was used to discover what the students thought of paraphrasing (2012). The results indicated that the ESL students did not think they should be held accountable if their paraphrasing was not as good as native English speaking students; even though, most of the EFL students believed that plagiarism is "a serious academic misconduct" (Sun, 2012). Sun's research also showed that low-readability texts were more often copied by students within their writing than high-readability texts. The students' views on plagiarism were not consistent with whether or not they borrowed words. This suggests that plagiarizing is a form of learning as stated in Chatterjee (2007).

Thompson and Williams (1995) discovered that their ESL students needed more than just lessons in paraphrasing, summarizing, and citing. Their lessons on

the prevention of plagiarism began with the students discussing whether or not a sample of text was plagiarized. They also read extensively about plagiarism, and then practiced referencing techniques (Thompson & Williams). However, their lessons were all in vain as the students still plagiarized in their homework after weeks of discussing the topic in class. Thompson and Williams asked their students to journal about plagiarism to find out what further actions the teachers needed to take. "The first thing we did was throw out the old one- and two-liners in our original activities and replace them with authentic, discourse-level materials" (Thompson & Williams). They introduced actual documents to the students and had them study how the authors used other authors' words in their writing. Two practices worth noting were the teachers asking the students to write what they had read without glancing at the article and having them write on a topic before researching it. The students were able to find ownership of their knowledge and use their own words. The students began to use other sources to "support" their words (Thompson & Williams). Thompson and Williams put teaching ESL students prevention of plagiarism in perspective when they said, "we had to give them ample opportunity to practice their newfound skills." The idea that ESL students have the ability to take direction from a simple *Do not do this!* does not help them. Plagiarism must be introduced to the students as a new concept that will change the way they view literature and their own words.

A Chinese undergraduate student of Pennycook's wrote a biography on Abraham Lincoln (Pennycook, 1996, p. 201). Pennycook says that the student's



text “had the ring of a text from elsewhere, of language borrowed and repeated” (1996, p. 202). He discovered that the student’s paper had been written from memory. It was a memory the student had retained from memorizing information about Abraham Lincoln during high school.

### **Intentional Plagiarism and Technology**

This interferes with Westernized notions in which cultures are more focused on the individual rather than the group; therefore, if a student is found plagiarizing texts, ideas, or material, the public responds to an illegal act (Sutherland-Smith, 2010; Jager & Brown, 2010). Sutherland found eighteen universities that used a type of “discourse” to describe those who plagiarized. Students were called ““offender”” a word used in “criminal law to describe the person charged with a criminal act” (Sutherland, 2010, p. 8). While others believe that ESL students plagiarize intentionally and that the studies suggesting otherwise receive their data from students whom have already been found plagiarizing (Lui). Cultural educational practices such as memorization and rote learning are also considered reasons behind students' copying words instead of using their own (Sowden, 2005). For ESL teachers, they may recognize the obvious change in their students' writing, but what should teachers do when they know this is happening? The on-going use of Internet websites such as this and the copy/paste method will only work for so long. Soon, students will have to write using their own words, channeling their own sense of self.

## **Chapter 3**

### **Research Methodology, Data Collection, and Data Analysis**

#### **Introduction**

The present study incorporated mixed methods as defined primarily by TESOL and conformed to their guidelines for case study, critical ethnography, constructivist grounded theory, and action research. Chapter 3 is a detailed description of data collection overview of the methods used to collect data for the thesis. This chapter will also include the data analysis. Chapter 4 is a reflection of the findings based on the guidelines of action research.

#### **Case Study**

This case study research aimed at understanding a bounded [specified] phenomenon by examining in depth, and in a holistic manner, one or more particular instances of the phenomenon. Case study research in TESOL and second language acquisition (SLA) has its origins in psychology and linguistics.

...recently, TESOL case studies have adopted the more subjective and interpretive stance typical of case studies in education...with less emphasis on the acquisition of discrete linguistic elements and more emphasis on such issues as learners' and teachers' identities, skill development and its consequences for learners. (TESOL.org, 2015, web)

The phenomenon investigated in the present study was plagiarism—specifically patch writing—and learners' previous instruction in MLA citation

and occasions when quoting is required in academic writing in their countries as well as in the United States.

In TESOL, a case typically refers to a person, either a learner or a teacher, or an entity, such as a school, a university, a classroom, or a program...Unlike ethnographic research, case studies do not necessarily focus on cultural aspects of a group or its members. Case study research may feature single cases or multiple cases (e.g., often two to four). (2015, web)

This case study focused on four individuals who represented different countries respectively and shared a learning environment in English 112.

### **Critical Ethnography**

The research in this thesis is an example of critical ethnography. Critical ethnography focuses on the setting and environment in which the research is taking place. The researcher views this environment as an entity with its own culture. Critical ethnography also acknowledges any assumptions or biases made by the researcher. “As in ethnography, bringing together (triangulating) multiple perspectives, methods, and sources of information” and in this study, “self-reports,” lessons student essays, instructor’s interpretations, and researcher’s perspectives add “texture, depth, and multiple insights to an analysis and...enhance the validity or credibility of the results” collected in a “natural” classroom setting. The research involved studying questionnaires given to the students that asked questions investigating what they had learned previously in

their home countries regarding plagiarism and MLA guidelines. These questionnaires helped create the backdrop to the research as it showed the primary researcher the students' ideas and opinions on how to share information.

### **Constructivist Grounded Theory**

The research was conducted using constructivist grounded theory. Constructivism is a philosophy that practices learning and reflection as new information is discovered or encountered. "When we encounter something new, we have to reconcile it with our previous ideas and experience, maybe changing what we believe, or maybe discarding the new information as irrelevant" (Educational Broadcasting Corporation, 2004, web). There is a meta-awareness to learning in constructivist theory. Researchers have the ability to change their minds and learn from what they are studying as new data is produced and examined. Grounded theory uses data "of any type e.g. video, images, text, observations, spoken word etc." (Scott, 2009, web). All elements within the researched environment are considered relevant in grounded theory so that information can be coded and synthesized. "Grounded theory is a research tool which enables you to seek out and conceptualize the latent social patterns and structures of your area of interest through the process of constant comparison" (Scott, 2009, web). It is through "constant comparison" of all the data collected that researchers can draw conclusions and connections, learning as the research

process expands, adding new information, and withdrawing from old theories to understand new concepts.

### **Action Research**

The research is an example of action research since the goal of the primary researcher was to find data that would help determine different ways to help students prevent unintentional plagiarism. “Specifically, action research in education can be defined as the process of studying a school situation to understand and improve the quality of the educative process” (Hine, 2013, web). The research focused on a “school situation” which was plagiarism and studied how the students responded to lessons on MLA guidelines and constant reminders by the thesis director and instructor to use these guidelines effectively. The primary researcher focused attention on students learning from the lesson on proper use of MLA and whether or not patch writing and rote memorization was discovered in the data. The primary researcher studied a “school situation” with the goal to create solutions for students and teachers that would “improve” the learning experience.

### **Research Methods and Procedure**

In the winter quarter of 2014, the primary researcher observed the English for Multi-lingual class and collected data for the thesis. There were 15 students enrolled in the class. The first thing the researcher did was create a questionnaire

that asked the students about their academic history and what they knew or did not know about plagiarism and citing sources while writing research papers. A couple of weeks later, the students were given a 15-minute lesson on citation requirements based on Purdue's rules for Modern Language Association (MLA).

The students were given a consent form to sign if they wished to participate in the research. Dr. Reeves explained to the class our interests in knowing what their background knowledge was in writing research papers and using references in their written work. The primary researcher gave a presentation to the students about paraphrasing. The presentation seemed to be well received. Dr. Reeves asked the students to take notes from each slide, which gave the students a memorization task to help them remember the rules to paraphrasing correctly. Some of the students were corrected on the spot when they were asked simple questions on how to paraphrase.

A handout was given to the students. This handout had quotes from a video the students had watched. The first quote on the page was paraphrased by the teacher. Next, the students were asked to paraphrase the next quotes while going through the steps on how to paraphrase that were given in the presentation. This exercise was designed to give the students practice as well as to give them a safe environment to make mistakes. Seeing the teacher paraphrase first, helped them relate to paraphrasing as an important and common skill. Paraphrasing exercises, like the one mentioned, done frequently in an American or ESL

classroom can benefit students by strengthening confidence and motivating students to avoid unintentional plagiarism.

TESOL reminds researchers to acknowledge “multiple realities....discerning the various perspectives of the researcher, the case/participant, and others, which may or may not converge” (2016, web) and in this case, the points of view of the multilingual writers, the researcher, and the instructor are included. “As an interpretive, inductive form of research, case studies explore the details and meanings of experience and do not usually attempt to test a priori hypotheses. Instead, the researcher attempts to identify important patterns and themes in the data” (web) and the researcher and instructor did identify themes in the answers to the questionnaire. Data analysis also involved identifying and coding the paraphrasing mistakes in whole essays written by three of the students as called for by TESOL: The richness of case studies is related to the amount of detail and contextualization that is possible when only one or a small number of focal cases and issues are analyzed” (web) to provide a compelling and engaging profile of the case, with suitable examples and linkages to broader issues, is also very important.

Further, TESOL asks researchers to:

provide sufficient contextual information about the case, including relevant biographical and social information...such as ESL learning...history, L1 background...data collection site(s), or other relevant descriptive information pertaining to the case and situation (web).

“Purposeful sampling is generally used in case study research...a convenience case” describes the present study because the thesis chair’s class was made available for the researcher to collect the questionnaire and teach a lesson on plagiarism. Since “multiple cases are used, researchers often provide a detailed account of each and then some form of cross-case comparison, either in prose or in a tabular summary,” and TESOL guidelines were followed here as well.

Data analysis may begin informally during interviews or observations and continue during transcription, when recurring themes, patterns, and categories become evident. Once written records are available, analysis involves the coding of data and the identification of salient points or structures (web). This coding will be explained later in this chapter.

In case studies, TESOL asks that researchers provide:  
sufficient evidence for...claims or interpretations to make them clear, credible, and convincing to others. Consider alternate explanations, and account for results that run contrary to the themes that emerge or for differences among triangulated sources (web).

The researcher and instructor spent considerable time during and after the data analysis to identify the elements that may have influenced the four writers’ essays they chose to examine up close, and this will be discussed further in Chapter 4. At the same time, they will make “connections between the case study and larger theoretical and practical issues in the field” in Chapter 4 in the discussion, connecting the findings to the literature in Chapter 2.



## **Questionnaire**

The questionnaire was given to the students the second week of the quarter. The questionnaire had five questions (Tables 1-5) that gauged the students' knowledge of using references and citing sources. They were allowed over 15 minutes to fill out the questionnaire.

Question 4 sparked the interest of a Saudi Arabian student. He asked Dr. Reeves how he should answer this question. He had not written a research paper in high school. Dr. Reeves explained to him and the rest of his classmates that they could write about any of their experiences with writing research papers. After the students finished the questionnaire, they were asked to give the documents to the primary researcher.

1. When using other people's words and/or ideas in your own language and in English as taught in your country, are you required
  - a. To show which are their words or ideas?
  - b. To write the name of the person whose ideas or words you are using in your paper?
2. Please explain what is expected of you by your teachers.

3. Is it ever okay in your country to copy other people's words and ideas without giving them credit?

a. Explain.

Number of students who replied with a "no" or "it's not okay."	
Number of students who replied with a tentative "yes." (I will further explain their reasons in the next chart.)	
Number of students who did not give a clear "yes" or "no."	

4. Write a paragraph here. Answer these questions. Be specific about what you have to write in your country K-12 and/or after high school-like in a college or a language institute. Describe a particular writing assignment you have done in either English or your own language and how you decided when to give another writer credit. (Continue on the back.)

5. Did the teachers explain MLA style for quoting in your papers and how to do Works Cited?

a. If so, how well did you understand the lesson?

b. If not, why do you think they did not teach you how and when to quote others or give them credit for their words or ideas? Explain in several complete sentences.

Number of students who misunderstood the question.	
Number of students who understood that the question referred to MLA citation.	
Number of students who did not answer the question.	

### **Presentation on Paraphrasing**

During the fifth week of the quarter, the primary researcher gave a presentation on how to paraphrase, to quote, and to cite sources. The presentation was based on information gathered from Purdue Online Writing Lab.

### **Final Essays**

The students turned in their final drafts of the in-class essays they had written throughout the quarter. Four students were chosen by the chair and the primary researcher to be the subjects of this case study. The primary researcher chose students from different parts of the world giving the case study cultural diversity. The students were from Saudi Arabia, Japan, Germany, and Spain. The Saudi Arabian student was a male, the others were female.

The following are unedited second drafts. They are presented in sets of three or four. The names have been changed.

## **Ibrahim**

March-2-2014

### **The Green Fields of France**

Eleanor, and Franklin faced WWI together. Each of them Eleanor, and Franklin had helped, and work to end the Great War. Franklin worked as a senator of the Navy, but Eleanor worked to help at a hospital as a nurse. At that time, they were working in Washington DC.

In this paragraph I am going to introduce a song that we have study with Dr. Reeves. The name of the song is "The Green Field of France". In fact, the song has got my emotion. The song is about a boy who is 19 years old, have died at WWI. The song did not imagine what is the boy nationality, but the song's writer tells the readers the boy's name. His name is Willie McBride. The writer wrote the song when he visited Willie's grave. The song is about WWI memorial. So, in the song the writer is pretending himself in a conversation with Willie McBride. I like the way the writer present himself in the begging of the paragraph, and when he asked Willie McBride if he could sit in his graveside politely. In conclusion, the song is like a conversation between the writer, and Willie McBride.

In this paragraph, I am going to copy two lines from the song; I am going to explain them as I understand, and I am going to connect to my life. "I hope you died well, and I hope you died clean. Young Willie McBride was it slow and Obscene?". When I was five years old, my mother has teach me to I be careful with my behavior, nor I do not hit otherss' feeling because I do not like others do things like that to me. This lessens still go, and forth in my mind. It is nice when I leave a place, which I was worked in, everyone in that place talking behind me about something good not bad. Sometime I feel I have effect others because of that they still remember the good memories not the bad of it. I wish when I leave the United State everyone who I have worked with include teachers, and friends will remember me, and taking about something good I have done. In short, most of the people around the world have wishes before they died, so one of my wishes to I live well, and clean.

In this paragraph I am going to explain another two lines from the song, and I will connect these two lines to my life. "In an old photograph, torn, battered and stained, and faded to yellow in a brown leather frame?". The photo with the time torn to yellow, and it is something usual happened to any photo even in this time, but the writer means here Willie's photograph. Willie when he died left behind him some of his photographs. The photographs had taken when he was young boy. Willie McBride pass away young, so his photo will shows us he will still young forever. My grandfather had not too many photograph, but when I see the photo I feel something in very sad is going on. In conclusion, the

writer did have some photos belong to Willie McBride, which is soo emotional when he saw these photos.

In this paragraph I am going to explain how the song is related to our chapter. This song is related to our chapter by showing us how WWI has effect too many parents around the world. Eleanor had lost two of her related in WWI who are Franklin 1<sup>st</sup>, and Franklin the youngest. it was a very sad period of time in the world , and it is sad when I read the numbers of the lost in the Great War, even if the numbers of WWII because the numbers include men, women, children, and seniors. Eleanor, and Franklin had work, and lost their related in the WWI. The United State has worked against the WWI, but that cause many death souls until the Great War get solve. In short, the WWI is a sad memory to remember, so Eleanor faced the Great War with a lot of unbelievable things were going on.

### **Reflection**

Writer 1 has a clear understanding of the connection between the song, “The Green Fields of France” and the chapter on Eleanor and Franklin during WWI. The prompt asks the students to connect lyrics from the song to things that have happened to them in life. Dr. Reeves wanted the students to relate to the song in order to gain a deeper understanding. It is clear Writer 1 has gained a personal connection to the song. He states, “In fact, the song has got my emotion.” He ends his essay by connecting Willie McBride’s death to the deaths of Eleanor’s sons who died in the war.

### **Analysis**

Ibrahim entitled his paper “The Green Fields of France” without putting the title into quotes. Entitling his paper the title of the song suggests that a reference for the teacher that this is what the essay will be about. However, one

could state that the title of Ibrahim's paper could be more specific to its function. For example, the essay requires students to connect the stories of Eleanor Roosevelt and "Willie McBride" (1), the soldier, being sung to in the song, to each other as well as connect a lyric of the song to the student's life. The title of Ibrahim's paper would more correctly be stated as, "Reflections on 'The Green Fields of France'." Otherwise, it appears that "The Green Fields of France" is a title created by Ibrahim for his paper.

The directions for the essay, stated at the bottom of the handout, are to use MLA citation when incorporating quotes from the song. Ibrahim uses quotes twice in the essay but does not give the line numbers. He also does not use the slash (/) to indicate the next line.

### **Ingeborg**

#### **Essay 3. The Green Fields of France**

Eleanor and Franklin lived during the 1<sup>st</sup> World War. The World War 1 took part in Europe during 1914-1918. During this time, Eleanor worked in canteens of the Red Cross. She served food and worked a lot. She showed that she loved to help other people and did voluntary work. Franklin worked as an assistant secretary for the navy.

World War 1 was called "The Great War" and "The War to ends Wars". If Americans wanted to participate in the war, they chose to go to Canada and serve with them. This changed when the United States entered the war in 1917 to help England and France. Many men were gone and therefore, the women tool over their jobs and worked as mechanics. Franklin also went to Europe to inspect American Naval Bases and tour the fighting fronts. Eleanor waited for her husband who got sick during his trip. He barely made it back to New York City and survived. The United States of America were in the war for one year.

The song "the Green Fields of France" written by Eric Bogle is a famous song about World War 1. The speaker goes to young Willie McBride's grave and

talks to him. On the gravestone the speaker can see that young Willie was only 19 when he joined the great fallen of 1916. (l.5-6). He hopes that this young man died in an honorable way (l.7).

The chorus of the song asked Willie McBride if the drum was beaten slowly and the fife lowly (l.9). This is the way how it usual occurs on a military funeral. Also, there is the death march placed and “The Last Post” or the “Flowers of the Forest”. The speaker asks all this while he is sitting at the gravestone. The chorus occurs a few times.

The last three strophes of the song are full of questions, too. The speaker wants to know if Willie McBride left somebody behind who will keep him in mind (l.13-14). Since he died in 1916 he will maybe stay forever 19 or he was maybe a stranger without even a name. Many soldiers who died during the war cannot be identified. The only thing that keeps them in mind is a picture that is framed. The speaker is in France at the gravel and the sun is shining with a summer breeze and the poppies dance. (l.21-23) In the graveyard where he is, is No Man’s Land. This means there was no place for the men and they died. The speaker wonders if all military men that lie in the graveyard know if they died (l.30). And did they believe that this one war would ends wars? The war was like killing animals for a slaughter. If you did not kill our opponent he would have killed you.

The song addresses all the people that fought for their country in wars and the ones that want wars. The speaker asked all these questions, and they make the listener think about war and if it is necessary to have war.

“Did you leave a wife or a sweetheart behind?” This quote means that a lot of the soldiers left their families behind when they left to fight in the war. For me, this is a special quote. I do not know if I am able to let my brother go and fight. I am glad he dies not have to go to the military, but my grandmother’s brother had to go. The lived during both world wars and her younger brother left the family to fight for Germany in the war. He never returned and my family is just able to guess where he maybe died. They do not know anything. It was hard for my grandmother, her parents and her older brother to wait and see if he comes back or not.

“Did you really believe that this war would end wars?” When the 1st World War started the majority of the people thought that this is the war to end wars. As we see now, it was not. I hate wars and I do not know why people have to fight in a war. I also know that a war cannot end wars. It is wrong to believe in this. In my opinion, it is possible to solve problems with words and not guns or other weapons. It starts with small arguments in a family and goes to arguments between countries. Words are the best weapons.

I think it is important to study a song like “The Green Fields of France” Nowadays, people need to know what happened in the past. A song like this is critical with wars and the questions that are used in it let the reader or listener think about it. The song shows that a war is not worth it to lose that many people’s lives. The song helps to understand that a war cannot solve all problems and that there is maybe a different way to solve arguments and differences between countries.

### **Reflection**

Ingeborg created a summary of the song, connected the book to the song, and wrote a reflection in which she relates her own life to the song’s lyrics. She explained her understanding of the lyrics in each paragraph. She captured the song’s tone and message by stating, “The speaker asked all these questions, and they make the listener think about war and if it is necessary to have war.”

Ingeborg’s tone was passionate and reflective. She wrote about her grandmother’s brother fighting in both wars and how it affected her family. She ended her essay declaring that she is against war and that people should learn from the song’s message.

### **Analysis**

Ingeborg knows that Eric Bogle is the author. Ingeborg uses full lines of the lyrics to explain what is happening in the song; although she gives the line numbers, she does not use quotation marks to indicate the words that are Bogle’s. Here is an example of her use of Bogle’s words:

*Bogle says:*

Well, how do you do, young Willie McBride? (1)



And I see by your gravestone you were only 19

When you joined the great fallen of 1916

I hope you died well and I hope you died clean (5-7)

*Ingeborg says:*

The speaker goes to young Willie McBride's grave and talks to him. On the gravestone the speaker can see that young Willie was only 19 when he joined the great fallen of 1916. (l.5-6). He hopes that this young man died in an honorable way (l.7).

There are indications that show that Ingeborg seems to be paraphrasing. She makes a sentence of her own that morphs into a lyric from Bogle. In the second sentence, she trades the pronoun "you" with the pronoun "he." The third sentence is arguably paraphrased successfully. Ingeborg uses "died in an honorable way" to replace "died well" and "died clean." However, she begins the sentence with "He hopes that this young man" in place of "I hope you" (Bogle, 7). Ingeborg does this sort of patch writing four times in her essay.

Ingeborg's most successful paraphrased sentence is, "The speaker wants to know if Willie McBride left somebody behind who will keep him in mind (l.13-14)." She is referencing Bogle's lines that state, "Did you leave a wife or sweetheart behind? / In some faithful heart is your memory enshrined" (13-14). Not only does she reference the line numbers, but also Ingeborg puts the line into her own words while keeping the meaning to the lyrics. Granted, she does borrow

the words “left” and “behind.” This is an information-based sentence that would be hard to reword to some degree especially for an ESL student.

Ingeborg also patch writes without giving the line numbers or referencing Bogle. She does this four times in her essay and once when she is using the interpretation that Dr. Reeves gave for the line 28 which states, “To a whole generation that were butchered and damned” (Bogle, 1976). Dr. Reeves commented on the handout that this line meant that the soldiers were “Killed like animals for slaughter.” Ingeborg writes, “The war was like killing animals for a slaughter.” This sentence is a paraphrase of Bogle’s lyrics. In truth, her sentence should end with a reference to the line number.

*Freedman says:*

Many women took over jobs usually held by men, working as mechanics, telegraph operators, and mail carriers. (Freedman, 58)

*Ingeborg says:*

Many men were gone and therefore, the women tool over their jobs and worked as mechanics.

*Freedman says:*

Franklin did go overseas that summer on an official mission to inspect American naval bases in Europe and tour the fighting fronts. (Freedman, 61)

*Ingeborg says:*

Franklin also went to Europe to inspect American Naval Bases and tour the fighting fronts.

## **Lordes**

### **GREEN FIELDS OF FRANCE**

Franklin and Eleanor, a couple with an important role in United States, lived into a period of time known as 'The Great depression' during the WWI because of this war, United States entered into it too, sending army soldiers to Europe (1914-1916). Despite having three children, Franklin had to leave the country and go to Europe to help and work as the assistant secretary of the navy while his wife stayed at home, but working in the canteens as a volunteer to help those involved in the war.

There is a song that represents really good and with detail that era. The song is composed by Eric Bogle and basically, it talks about how a young man, who has died during the war and probably for his country, dies being only nineteen years old. Nineteen is nothing, which means he had all his life in front of him, all his life to live yet. But for some reason, his life, as it happened to a lot of people, ended a lot earlier. Now, all his family has from him is an old picture and memories of his dear son, brother... The thing is that the singer asks him, being sit next to his rip, if all that fights, that blood, that deaths... if all that was worth it, because the war kept and the losses were a lot, even if today, the 'sun raises and shines under the clouds'.

There are some lines into the song that I can use to explain both, the song and how it's related to my life. One of the sentences says "I hope you died well and I hope you died clean." With this sentence, the man who sit next to his rip, is wondering how he died, hoping that at least it was not bad. For me, it means something similar. When I think about any loss in my family members, all I want is not to suffer. Not for me, but for the person who passes away. I think the best way to say goodbye to someone you love is being happy, with a smile in the face, being thankful for all we have lived and most of all, if some day that happens to me, I will be so thankful for the great people I am having around me.

Another sentence chosen from the song is "Well, the suffering, the sorrow, the glory, the pain." Poor young man as well as all those who went to fight and who suffered from all those battles. This sentence that I relate with my life does not have anything to do with the war. for me, this means sacrifice, sacrifice for fighting for what I believe. Referred to my sport's life, this represents that if I believe in something, I have to go for it. I know it is hard sometimes, it is painful others, and I do not always get what I had expected to get. However, I feel if I do not try, I will never be sure if I could do it (break 4'30" in 1500 or going to the

world championships for track and field in my category). Just because something hurts and it is hard to reach, does not mean is not going to be worth it.

I personally think this is a great song. Not only because it is a context of how hard that era was, but also because through the song, we can see the general feeling and emotions, the sadness because of the disasters caused by the war. I think even being without a member of their family (the family who suffer their son's dead), they were proud of him because after all, he died fighting for what he believed and for what he wanted to protect (his country). The courage he show going into the war with only 19 years is something not everybody has. And it is something to be proud of.

### **Reflection**

Lordes followed the instructions for the prompt and connected the book to the song and the song lyrics to her own life. Then she explained how she felt about the song and why she thought the song was good. She related the lyrics to her life by reading into the song's meaning. To Lordes, the lyric "Well, the suffering, the sorrow, the glory, the pain" was a testimony of Willie McBride doing what was needed of him at the time even when his actions caused his own suffering. She related to the lyric because it reminded her of her struggles with sports. She said, "Just because something hurts and it is hard to reach, does not mean is not going to be worth it" (Lordes, para 4). She believed that Willie McBride died for a cause that he "believed in", however, she saw that there was value and "courage" (para. 5) in his plight.

### **Analysis**

Lordes entitles her essay "GREEN FIELDS OF FRANCE." Lordes does not copy from Freedman's book. She successfully summarizes in her introduction the beginning of WWI and what the Roosevelts did during this time. However, she does not make mention of the book or the author. It is a possibility that Lordes is considering her audience who is Dr. Reeves and Lordes' classmates. Everyone has read the book Lordes has received her information from. Her essay could be summarizing what she feels she does not have to reference, otherwise she might come across as being too redundant.

Lordes uses quotes from "Green Fields of France" twice in her essay. She does not reference the line numbers to these quotes. Lordes, however, does mention that Eric Bogle is the author of the song, and she understands that the singer is not the songwriter.

Lordes' second paragraph is strong in rhetorical devices. She seems to read into the lyrics, inferring much of what wasn't said. For example, Lordes writes, "Now, all his family has from him is an old picture and memories of his dear son, brother...." She ends her sentence with an ellipsis. In fact, she does this twice in the paragraph. Admirably, this is beautifully done, for she has crafted a sense of inevitability for Willie McBride, who died in the war. The problem with her inference, however, is that Bogle does not mention Willie McBride's family, but only asks if he "[left] a wife or a sweetheart behind" (13).

Lordes also incorporates some craft elements from Bogle when she paraphrases a line from the song without referencing it:

The thing is that the singer asks him, being sit next to his rip, if all that fights, that blood, that deaths...if all that was worth it, because the war kept and the losses were a lot, even if today, the ‘sun raises and shines under the clouds’.

Lordes’ words, “that fights, that blood, that deaths” is similar to Bogle’s “Well, the suffering, the sorrow, the glory, the pain / the killing and the dying was all done in vain” (33-34). Lordes mentioned that “the singer asks him”, but she does not reference the line numbers. She molds two lines from the song together at the end with “sun raises and shines under the clouds’.” She puts singular quotes around this to show she took it from the song albeit incorrectly stated. The two lines from the song are, “The sun now it shines on the green fields of France” (21) and “And look how the sun shines from under the clouds” (23). Lordes has combined the meanings of these two lines together into something of her own; although she does put singular quotes around her patch writing showing that she understands the origin of her words. Her later direct quotes from the song are given full quotation marks. She seems to be mixing MLA citation with her own rhetorical device to provide more emphasis on her interpretation of the song.

## Masayo

### “Green Fields of France”

After Franklin and Eleanor Roosevelt married, he became the Assistant Secretary of the Navy. At that time, in 1914, World War I started in Europe. The war was between the Allies and the Central European powers in Europe. The Allies were led by the United Kingdom and France. Central power were Germany and central European countries. World War I started in 1914 and ended in November 1918. At first, the United States didn't enter the war. But American ships were attacked by Germany, after that the United States entered in the Allis since 1917. In this war, many U.S soldiers including Elleanor's relatives, were killed and victimized.

There is a famous song written about World War I. The titled “The Green Fields of France” written by Eric Bogle. This song is about one young soldier who died in 1916 during World War I. He was nineteen years old, and his name was Willie McBride. His gravestone was in the green fields of France. The speaker stops at his grave and speaks to the dead man in the grave in this song. The song tells us a sad story due to his death, his gravestone, the scene of green fields, his instrument and his photograph.

Bogel writes, “When you joined the great fallen of 1916 / I hope you died well and I hope you died clean / Young Willie McBride, was it slow and obscene?” (6-8). The songwriter is asking if the man didn't die fast or easily. He asks if his death was very slow and painful and bad, like a shrapnel wound or infection. It was common in World War I for people to have very painful and slow deaths from shrapnel or poison gas. Sometimes it wasn't a fast and easy death like a bullet in the head, or something like this. The songwriter has empathy for very young soldiers and he hopes his death was honorable.

Bogel writes, “There's no gas, no barbed wire, no guns firing now / But here in this graveyard is still No Man's Land / The countless white crosses stand mute in the sand” (24-26). By this, the songwriter means that now the war ended and here it is peaceful, but there are still traces of the damage caused by the war. The white crosses represent the war dead-100,000+ World War I American soldiers who were are buried in Europe. Many American soldiers were victims of the war. We must not forget the sadness and suffering through the white crosses in the Green Fields of France, many of white crosses have no name.

In conclusion, we should study World War I, because we should know how many victims there were. And we should think whether the war was really necessary or not. Now, we can live without inconvenience, but conflicts of nations and civil wars are happening still around the world. We need to study about what is gained and lost from the war. We need to know that military power

isn't only solution to conflict. The war, it happened again and again, many victims and pain left as a result. We should study the war so that this sad story never happens again.

### **Analysis**

Masayo entitles her essay the same title as the song, "The Green Fields of France" by Eric Bogle (1976); however, she uses quotation marks. This does not make it understood whether or not she is referencing the song's title or the title of her paper. The instructions for this essay are to explain what was happening in Eleanor Roosevelt's life when World War 1 began. After this introduction, the students are asked to interpret the song. Masayo uses two quotes from the song and successfully gives the line numbers.

The song lyrics were printed and given to the students by the teacher. Incorporated onto the handout were side notes made by the teacher to help them understand the lyrics' meaning. Line 26 says, "The countless white crosses stand mute in the sand" (Bogle, 1976). Dr. Reeves' comment twelve, which interprets lyric 26, says, "Silent; unable to speak; here the white crosses represent the war dead---100,000+ WWI American Soldiers are buried in Europe---Allied troops are buried in 926 cemeteries in France alone" (Reeves, 2011). This comment is meant to be a scaffold to help the students understand what is being said by this lyric 26:

Masayo explains:

Bogel writes, "There's no gas, no barbed wire, no guns firing now / But here in this graveyard is still No Man's Land / The countless white crosses stand



mute in the sand” (24-26). By this, the songwriter means that now the war ended and here it is peaceful, but there are still traces of the damage caused by the war. The white crosses represent the war dead---- 100,000+ World War I American soldiers who were are buried in Europe.

Masayo has incorporated Dr. Reeves’ words to her paper without a reference.

At the end of her essay, Masayo also uses a phrase she has taken from the lyrics of the song, but this time she does not reference the song or the author:

“The war, it happened again and again, many victims and pain left as a result.”

Bogle writes in his song, “For Willie McBride, it all happened again, / and again, and again, and again, and again” (35-36).

### **Masayo**

#### **Hobo’s Lullaby**

Do you know hobo? Hobo is people who don’t have house and job. So they are very poor, they lived under train. About 80 years ago, train was free, hobos travel by train in this period of American history. There were one story which about one hobo and little girl. The purpose of this essay is to introduce the life of hobos in the Great Depression, to tell a story of hobos who changed a girl’s life forever, and to analyze the song, “Hobo’s Lullaby.”

First, I will define hobos and explain the life of the hobo during this period of American history. Hobos were very poor people and didn’t have job and house due to this American society. They were always hungry. Franklin Roosevelt was president in this story’s period of America. One little girl’s house was marked by the hobo in this story, because this house’s mother gave food to the hobo. She was very generous. When her daughter was eight-grade, one old hobo came her house back at the door. At that moment, she through her book down, because she was very weak in reading. The book author was Shakespeare. The hobo helped her to read the book. They spend all the afternoon to read the book. Many years later, she became a professor of English literature. In fact, the

hobo who read the book for her was professor of English literature. The life of her could change through the one day's afternoon.

Next, I will retell the story the lady told the singer, Mr. Bill Schustik, at one of his concerts and that he shared on his YouTube video we watched in our composition class this quarter. The song's title was "hobo's lullaby." Before he sang the song with guitar, he told the story about one old hobo and little girl. And then, he sang the song "hobo's lullaby." This song gives a hope hobos who have great depression. The last chorus in this song is "I know your pillow are torn and ragged. And your hair is turning grey. Lift your head and smile at trouble. You'll find happiness someday." The songwriter has sympathy and respect toward the hobo.

Next, I will analyze the message of the story the singer told before he sang the song. The message of the story is that a people who have great talent might become poor due to society in this period in America. It was very important relationship between the girl and the hobo for each other. They were influenced by each other through just one day on a back porch. The writer wanted to tell us about the hobo that they had great depression in poor life, but they had warm-hearted. The listener of song should think about how agony of their life and what condition in the period of America.

Finally, I will suggest a hidden message that the story might tell and tell the most important lesson I learned from this lesson taught by Dr. Reeves. I think we shouldn't discrimination against all the people in the world, whether a race, social class, gender, handicapped and so on. We shouldn't judge the people from only looking and background. Everybody have to respect each other.

### **Analysis**

Masayo entitled her essay "Hobo's Lullaby," which is what Ibrahim did with his essay. The directions for this essay were to write about hobos and to analyze the lyrics to the song "Hobo's Lullaby" written by Goebel Reeves (1961) and sung by Bill Schustik. The title to her essay could have been, "A Summary and Interpretation of Bill Schustik's Rendition of 'The Hobo's Lullaby' by Goebel Reeves."

Masayo, also like Ibrahim, does not use the line numbers for the poem. She quotes the lyrics once in her essay.

There is ambiguity in Masayo's essay. Schustik tells the story of a woman who approached him after one of his concerts to tell him about her encounter with a hobo when she was a young teen. In the introduction of Masayo's essay, she writes, "The purpose of this essay is to introduce the life of hobos in the Great Depression, to tell a story of hobos who changed a girl's life forever..." (p. 1). In the second paragraph, she explains what a hobo is and then tells the story of the teen girl: "One little girl's house was marked by the hobo in this story, because this house's mother gave food to the hobo." She does not state where she has heard this story. In the following paragraph, Masayo writes, "Before [Schustik] sang the song with guitar, he told the story about one old hobo and little girl." Masayo does not explain that this story is the same story she explained in the previous paragraph. She seems not to know to whom to attribute the information.

Masayo does not capitalize the title of the song nor does she mention the author's name.

## **Ingeborg**

### **Essay 1. Hobo's Lullaby**

The Great Depression in the United States took place between 1929 and 1939. During this time, many people lost their jobs. 1500 people were unemployed at this time. These people started to live on the streets, and mainly men were travelling to find a new job.

The purpose of this essay is (1) to introduce the life of the hobos in the Great Depression, (2) to tell a story of one hobo who changed a girl's life forever, and (3) to analyze the song, "Hobo's Lullaby".

The story in the video is told by Bill Schustik. Bill Schustik is a troubadour which means he is a travelling singer. At one of his concerts, a woman got reminded by his song of her own story. After the concert, she tells Bill

Schustik her story. He tells her story first, and then he sings the song “Hobo’s Lullaby,”

First I will define hobo and explain the life of the hobo during this period of American history. A hobo is a homeless person who is travelling to find work. Hobos used the train to travel, because it was free for them. It was free, because they jumped on the trains and were no official passengers. Hobos sneaked on the trains. They jumped on these trains and when they saw a marked house, they left the train. Hobos marked places where they can find a place to stay and to eat. It was not the house that was marked. They marked a tree or a bush in front of the house so the hobos on the trains were able to see the marks. At the marks they were able to stay at the house for a while. Sometimes, they could sleep in the back porch, but they never slept in the hous

Next, I will retell the story the lady told the singer, Mr. Bill Schustik, at one of his concerts that he shared on his YouTube video we watched in our composition class this quarter. The song addresses the hobos themselves. It says that the hobo can hear the steel rails humming at night and that this is a hobo’s lullaby (Chorus, Hobo’s Lullaby). Furthermore, it says that the hobo should not think about tomorrow and think positive, because the hobo is safe. “Tonight you are in a nice warm boxcar. Safe from all the wind and snow” (Hobo’s Lullaby, 7-8). Also, the song says that the police cause trouble, but they do it everywhere. And if the hobo goes to heaven, there he will not see a policemen anymore (Hobo’s Lullaby, 9-12). He will not see a policemen in heaven, because everybody in heaven is equal and no ranks exist. It is quiet and silent. The last part of the song gives the reader clues about the hobo’s age. “And your hair is turning grey” (Hobo’s Lullaby, 14). Also, it shows that the songwriter wants the hobo to think positive when it comes to the last two lines “Lift your head and smile at trouble. You’ll find happiness someday” (Hobo’s Lullaby, 15-16). All in all the songwriter wants the hobo to see the positive side of his life and to enjoy it.

Next, I will analyze the message of the story the singer told before he sang the song. The story is about a little girl who has struggle with her English assignment during The Great Depression. Her mother always baked for the hobos and one afternoon one of the hobos helps the girl who is in the 8<sup>th</sup> grade with her homework. The whole afternoon, he reads the story of Shakespeare out loud to her. The girl gets inspired by the hobo and starts to get a graduation as a teacher for English literature. Later on, she becomes a professor for English literature at a University and finds out that the hobo was a professor for English literature, too. This shows that everybody could have become a hobo during The Great Depression.

The fact that the people helped the hobos shows that a lot of people were hobos. Everybody, even a family member could have become a hobo and therefore the people helped each other during The Great Depression. This song

shows that during the Great Depression people were still able to find happiness and to give something to people. The family gave the hobos something to eat and the one hobo helped the girl in school. Also, it helps the people who are listening to the song that hobos were educated and that they just had bad luck. It shows that people at this time could lose everything and then suddenly have nothing. The relationship between the girl and the hobo is a symbol for the trust people had. Her mum trusted the hobo and was not afraid of him. If she had been afraid she would not have let them sit together the whole afternoon.

Finally, I will suggest a hidden message that the story might tell and the most important lesson I learned from this lesson taught by Dr. Reeves. A hidden message could be, that a hobo is not a bad person only because he has to live on the streets. This means, that people may have had bad luck that caused them homelessness. It showed me that I should not judge people just because of their outward appearance they have towards me. I should not judge people because of their life, because I do not know what causes them to live their life. I know that everybody can become homeless. It is not only because people are lazy to work. No, it is about how one's life goes and what happens. Some people can have a bad fortune and some always have a good fortune.

### **Analysis**

For "Hobo's Lullaby," "The Green Fields of France," and "Triangle Factory Fire," Ingeborg names her essays the same title without quotation marks.

In her essay on "The Hobo's Lullaby" by Goebel Reeves, Ingeborg does not mention the author of the song, but she does mention the singer, Bill Schustik.

Ingeborg makes some paraphrasing mistakes in her third paragraph. She successfully quotes from the song three times by putting them in quotation marks and showing the line numbers; however, instead of putting the author's name before the line number, she inserts the song's title. For example, Ingeborg writes, "Also, the song says that the police cause trouble, but they do it everywhere. And if the hobo goes to heaven, there he will not see a policemen anymore (Hobo's Lullaby, 9-12)." Ingeborg has done some patch writing for this reference. She has

copied most of the words but has changed a few. For this example, she does not use quotation marks. The original lines from the song are:

Well I know the police will cause you trouble / They cause trouble everywhere / But when you've died and gone to heaven / There will be no policeman there (Reeves, 1961).

Ingeborg does this again two other times in her essay. She copies phrases without attaching quotation marks:

It says that the hobo can hear the steel rails humming at night and that this is a hobo's lullaby (Chorus, Hobo's Lullaby). Furthermore, it says that the hobo should not think about tomorrow and think positive, because the hobo is safe.

The lyrics say, "Can't you hear the steel rails hummin'" and "Do not worry about tomorrow." Ingeborg has taken whole parts of these lines and has written about them without putting them in quotes or giving adequate referencing devices. She does however mention the song and the fact that all of her information is derived from it. Although there is some copying here, whether patch written or not, these examples of Ingeborg's are examples of unintentional plagiarism. Even if she intended to paraphrase, MLA requires a citation for paraphrases.

## **Lordes**

### **TRIANGLE FACTORY FIRE**

Back in 1911, a great catastrophe revolutionized the American workplace. I took place on March 25 in 1911, when a factory called "Triangle Factory" located in N.Y. City broke into fire. The Factory was located in the upper part of

the building, more specifically, in the top three floors. It was around 4:40pm that afternoon of a sunny spring day when everything happened. The purpose of this essay is (1) to tell the story of the fire, (2) too explain labor conditions of the early 1900s in the U.S, (3) to describe the labor reforms that resulted, and (4) to detail the project that was started by one of the owner's granddaughters to honor the dead workers.

First, I will tell the story of the fire on that Friday afternoon more than 100 years ago. As I started to say before, the fire took place at 4:40pm in N.Y. City. It was what a lot of Americans call 'quitting time', because it's time to go home. It was an inferno what all those workers suffered that day. And not only for the, but also for the onlookers that were witnessing the scene from the outside of the building. Everything started with a little cigarette dropped by someone into the Factory. Being a clothing factory, it made so much easier to char the interior of the floor. When people realized that the escape stairs were collapsed and one of the exit doors that should be open was not, everyone started to jump from the windows trying to escape from there. It was completely a deathtrap. The expressions on the faces from those onlookers on the pavement of the sidewalks were terrifying. Because of this, a lot of reforms started to be taken to prevent for the future fire accidents, providing fire escapes and to know that the death of all those workers (146) was not in vain.

Next, I will explain labor conditions of the early 1900s in the U.S., particularly the conditions in the Triangle Factory that lead to the death of almost one third of the workers that afternoon. As you probably know, those who were working in the factories were paid little amounts of money and working too many hours, were not Native Americans. Instead of that, they were usually immigrants and the people that had the need to survive, even if it meant their exploitation. According to the United States Department of Labor, "the high proportion of uneducated, non-English speaking immigrants working in (factories)" and there was "little attempt to teach them about the dangers on their jobs and few warning signs." This quote shows perfectly which ones were the conditions workers had to deal with. Their bosses were not 'wasting' time teaching them things that were not going to bring them any advantage (to the boss) or any money. Then, when something happen as it did in 1911, the workers not only do not know how to act but also they did not have the 'exit door' unlocked as it was supposed to be. This is why this event changed the way and the rules of the labor in the United States, providing more rights to the workers and making sure that the rules are followed by the bosses from the factories.

Next I will explain how the women are being remembered every year at the factory building. A descendant of one of the founders of the Factory felt blamed for the catastrophe and decided to do something to remember those who did not survive. Every year, as sign of memorial to those victims, a ring bells 146 times remembering each of them. Not only that, but also schools make visits to the location the fire took place to remember them and to teach them how to react in those 'fire situations'. It's a good way to teach them 'safety'.

Finally, I will introduce the memorial project that was started by one of the owner's granddaughters to honor the dead workers. As I said before, Susan Harris, the granddaughter of Max (factory owner) decided to do something to remember all the deaths. She decided to honor the victims by stitching the names of the dead, including her own relatives. The act received the name of Prayer Flags.

### **Analysis**

Lordes successfully summarizes the CBS news clip of the Triangle Factory Fire called, "Remembering the Triangle Shirtwaist Fire" reported by Michelle Miller without copying the narrator's words. However, she does make one mistake. Miller's "beautiful Saturday" becomes Lordes' "sunny spring day." She mirrors Miller's antithesis "beautiful Saturday" versus the "inferno" to come.

### **Ibrahim**

#### **Triangle Factory Fire**

In New Amsterdam (New York), March-25- 1911 near to the Time Square, there was a factory. In addition, the factory was in the 10<sup>th</sup> floor. At 4:40- fire burn in the 3th floor by a cigarette. It was a deathtrap for 500 workers in that factory. On that day the United States was united in grief. The purpose of this essay is (1) to tell the story of the fire (2) to explain labor conditions of early 1900s in the United States, (3) to describe labor reforms that resulted, and (4) to detail the project that was started by one of the owner's granddaughters to honor the dead workers.



Frist of all, I will tell the story of the fire one that Friday afternoon more than 100 years ago. On that Factory were around 500 workers most of then were from Italy, and Jaws women, and immigrants. The women in that day were useless, because the doors were locked, and only one fire escape. In short, that day was an awful day. The United States law has changed after what happened in that factory.

Next, I will explain labor conditions of early 1900s in the United States, particularly the condition in the Triangle Factory that lead to death of almost one third of the workers that afternoon. The doors were closed, and only one escape could not handle the 500 workers, and the escape had collapsed because it was too mush people. According to the United States Department of labor, “The high proportion of unedited non-English speaking immigrants working in [factories]” and there was “little attempt on their jobs, and a few wearing signs: (accessed 4 May 2012 Web).

Next, I will explain how the women are being remembered every year at the factory building. Susan Harris had made a pray flay. She is show respect to the death workers. That day have shocked people up because of Michael Hirsh said “it was a mirror to what happened in 9/11”. Many of the families victims have blame Max Blancke who was the owner of that factory. Onlookers who were near to the factory

### **Analysis**

Ibrahim uses the phrase “Triangle Factory Fire” as the title to his essay.

This is not considered a violation of the correct use of appropriation of words considering that the Triangle Factory fire is an occurrence in history. There was a factory called Triangle that caught on fire. Ibrahim’s entitling the essay “Triangle Factory Fire” acknowledges that he has written about an historical event.

Ibrahim writes:

“On that Factory were around 500 workers most of then were from Italy, and Jaws women, and immigrants” (p. 1).

On the CBS News video, the reported, Michele Miller, says:

“...in New York’s Greenwich village where 500 workers, mostly young Italian and Jewish women and girls, got ready to collect their pay and go home.”

Ibrahim appropriated the words “500 workers, mostly young Italian and Jewish women and girls” by the use of patch writing: “500 workers most of the[m] were from Italy, and [Jewish] women.” The sentence structure is similar and the information is listed in the same manner, but it is not a perfect copy because the slight changes he made in the phrasing. For example, “mostly” (Miller) became “most of the[m].” “[...] young Italian and Jewish women” became “were from Italy, and [Jewish] women.” Lastly, Ibrahim decides to leave out “and girls.” It is obvious that he listened and copied his information from this statement made by Miller.

Ibrahim used a quote from the video, “it was a mirror to what happened in 9/11.” He first says, “Michael Hirsch said” and then gives the statement. His reference to a quote from the video is done correctly, but he made the mistake of referencing the wrong person. It was Michelle Miller who makes this statement in the video.

### **Ingeborg**

#### **Essay 2. Triangle Factory Fire**

On March 26 in 1911 on a beautiful spring day in New York City a fire broke out in the Triangle Factory, killing 146 people, mainly women. The purpose of this essay is (1) to tell the story of the fire, (2) to explain labor reforms that resulted, and (4) to detail the project that was started by one of the owner’s granddaughters to honor the dead worker

First, I will tell the story of the fire on that Friday afternoon more than 100 years ago.

It happened at quitting time when the top three levels of a factory started to burn. This means level 8, 9, and 10 were on fire. This huge inferno was caused by a match or cigarette that fell on the ground. The fire consumed its top floor quickly and the people tried to use fire escapes to get out of the building. These broke down under the weight of the mass of people and therefore, the people in the top floors were caught. The fire department tried to help the workers, but their ladders only reached to the seventh or sixth floor. Many onlookers were on the pavement and they could not help the workers, who were locked in the factory. Therefore, many workers jumped out of the windows and died. The whole city united in grief for all the victims of the fire. To identify the victims there was a Makeshift morgue in front of the burned factory. There are many questions why this fire killed that many people and why they were not able to escape the fire. This revolutionized the American workplace.

Next, I will explain labor conditions of the early 1900's in the United States, particularly the conditions on the Triangle Factory that led to the death of almost one third of the workers that afternoon. Mainly non-English speaking immigrants worked in factories and they did not learn a lot about the dangers in their jobs and a few warning signs. (United States Department of labor, 4 May 2014 web) This shows that the workers did not know what to do in a situation like the one in 1911. The labor conditions were extremely bad. This means that it should not be allowed to smoke inside the building where a lot of cloth is used. Also, the fire escape needs to handle that many people and should not collapse. And how can it be possible that the doors are locked. There was no way out for the workers except of the windows and not even the ladders reached high enough.

Next, I will explain how women are being remembered every year at the factory building. Michael Hirsch started a project to find living relatives of the women who died. On the gravestones he saw that the names were disappearing and this made him start to take care for their graves and find living relatives. Every year there is a memorial service for all the victims where the factory was used to be. They ring a bell 146 times. Each ring stands for one victim of the fire. We need to remember this day, because it shows us that we need to have good labor conditions so that this will never happen again. Therefore, the NYC school children go to the factory. They see why it is important to know how to handle a situation with a fire. This is the reason why teachers take them there every year. This helps the children to understand how important safety is.

Finally, I will introduce the memorial project that was started by one of the owner's granddaughters to honor the dead workers. Susan Harris came across a book and found out with the help of Michael Hirsch that Max Blancke is her relative. He was the owner of the Triangle Factory. Since then, Susan Harris started to stitch a handkerchief for each victim. She sewed the name of the victim on

it, too. With this action, she wanted to show her feelings for the victims and their relatives. These handkerchiefs should help to keep all of them in memory and that many of them died as heroes by saving the life of many others, like Fanny Lasner. She was one of the victims, but she helped other women to escape from the fire.

### **Analysis**

Ingeborg uses the word “beautiful” to describe the day of the factory fire.

Miller reports, “‘On that day,’ says researcher Michael Hirsch, ‘All of New York was united in grief’”. Ingeborg says, “The whole city united in [grief] for all the victims of the fire.”

Within the directions of the assignment, Dr. Reeves asks the students to add this quote to their essay:

According to the United States Department of Labor, “The highest proportion of uneducated, non-English speaking immigrants working in [factories]” and there was “little attempt to teach them about the dangers on their jobs and few warning signs” (accessed 4 May 2012 web).

Ingeborg incorporates this quote into her essay:

Mainly non-English speaking immigrants worked in factories and they did not learn a lot about the dangers in their jobs and a few warning signs. (United States Department of Labor, 4 May 2014 web)

Ingeborg does not put quotation marks around these quotes, but instead she patch-writes the two sentences together and then attaches the referencing information.

Miller says, "When she [Susan Harris] was a teenager, she came across a book and a name that looked familiar." Ingeborg says, "Susan Harris came across a book and found out with the help of Michael Hirsch that Max Blanche is her relative." The phrase "came across a book" is a common phrase that could have been aurally memorized, or it could have been copied. Ingeborg is not stealing any idea, but she is using Miller's rhetorical craft.

Miller says, "Erica Lasner discovered that her 21-year-old aunt Fanny was a hero that day, saving the lives of many of her co-workers before jumping to her own death." Ingeborg says, "These handkerchiefs should help to keep all of them in memory and that many of them died as heroes by saving the life of many others, like Fanny Lasner." The phrase "saving the life of many others" has been used in place of Miller's "saving the lives of many of her co-workers." Ingeborg is no longer speaking of just Fanny but offering the possibility that there may have been other woman who saved lives that day. She could be appropriating Miller's words in order to say what she wants to say correctly.

### **Masayo**

#### **Condition of Labor-Triangle Factory Fire in 1911**

March 25 in 1911, a beautiful spring day in New York City, the serious fire happened. The building, which many women worked in the upper 3rd floor, happened the fire. Over one hundred worker women were involved the fire. The time was 4p.m, just worker go to home. The 146 workers were dead by this fire. This tragedy had some reasons. One of them is lack of safety coded in the building. This fire was caused by very bad labor condition. The purpose of this essay is to tell the story of the fire, to explain labor conditions of the early 1900s in the United States, to describe labor reforms that resulted, and to detail the

project that was started by one of the owner's granddaughters to honor the dead workers.

First, I will tell the story of the fire on that Friday afternoon more than 100 years ago. The building was like inferno and deathtrap. The building consumed its top floor and collapsed desperate. The worker made product of clothes in the factory called Triangle Factory in this building. When the fire happened, just before everybody go home, so 146 women worker involved and dead by this fire. This building was very bad condition for safe. When the fire happened, the door locked, so they couldn't escape the fire. As a result, they had to jumped to outside to escape the fire.

Next, I will explain labor conditions of the early 1900s in the United States, particularly the conditions in the Triangle Factory that lead to the death of almost one third of the workers that afternoon. According the United States Department of Labor, "The high proportion of uneducated, non-English speaking immigrants working in factories" and there was "little attempt to teach them about the dangers in their jobs and few warning signs"(accessed 4 May 2012 web). Actually, the workers of these victims were many immigrants and young girls. Almost victims didn't know how to escape the fire, because the factory didn't have fire escape.

So they had to jump to outside due to locked the door. Even though this factory was making clothes factory, so the fire spread very quickly, the factory didn't move sprinklers.

Next, I explain how the women are being remembered every year at the factory building. Michael Hirsch, he investigate the fire and makes project to find living relatives of the women who died. Their gravestones were fading of the names. So he makes a plan to reforms their gravestones. Every year there is a memorial service in front of the building where the factory used to be. They ring a bell 146 times as same as the number of victims. We must remember the deceased workers to never tragedy happen. NYC school children go to the factory and they hear and see about the fire and victims. The teacher teaches them how cruel the fire and tells the story to never forget it.

Finally, I will introduce the memorial project that was started by one of the owner's granddaughter to honor the dead workers. Her name was Susan Harris. Her Grandfather, May Blancke, he was the owner of the factory. Isaac Harris, he locked the door of factory. Both of them were criticized New York citizen, but a jury acquitted them. Their family left New York to escape the criticism. The fire was a family secret and changed the name their descendants. However Harris noticed the fact and asked her mother. She had courage and very sympathy for the victims. Even thought she might receive blame, she started a project. She makes handkerchiefs from shirtwaist fabric. The handkerchiefs have

stitching of 146 women worker's name. The worker should not be forgotten, to never repeat the cruel industrial accident in the future.

### **Analysis**

Michele Miller says, "It was late in the afternoon, on a beautiful spring Saturday, March 25<sup>th</sup> 1911..." at the beginning of the video. Masayo writes, "March 25 in 1911, a beautiful spring day in New York City..." at the beginning of her essay. Masayo has rearranged the sentence putting the date of the factory fire at the beginning of her sentence and then following it with Miller's "beautiful spring." Masayo uses the word "day" in place of "Saturday." This is an example of patch writing. She has appropriated Miller's words possibly with the intention to copy the feeling of irony Miller delivers by stating that the day of the fire was "beautiful." Masayo borrows the antithesis, contracting the beauty of the day with the horror of the fire. Both the wording and the more abstract use of the lit device of copied.

## **Chapter 4**

### **Data Analysis and Reflection**

Chapter 4 is a discussion of the findings with connections made to the literature reviewed in Chapter 2. It is also the researcher's and the instructor's reflection on the diverse kinds of unintentional plagiarism and/or patch writing that they identified in the case study—many of which were unexpected. In this respect it is a synthesis of major concepts with some new categories that have emerged which may relate to multilingual writers' ways of incorporating others' words and ideas, and which may also reflect cultural transfer from the first language.

The recurring message in the literature is the need for more teacher/student discussions about academic integrity and plagiarism (Abukhattala, 2012) and how it may differ from academic practices in other cultures (Handa & Power, 2005). Thomas and Williams's (1995) students acknowledged the differences several times. Although Lui (2005) and Abukhattala may disagree, as teachers we cannot ignore what the students say. Following Thomas and Williams's curriculum may be helpful for students, but there are other possibilities that can enhance students' autonomy.

The first draft to essays could be written in class. This will help the students gather their thoughts without any escape to source materials and computers. Writing in class has many advantages. The students are able to ask their teachers questions if they are unable to find the right words, and they are able to channel their English abilities. Encouraging the students to write, teachers will take away stress factors that alienate students from their own work. Kwong's (2010) research says that students are tempted to



plagiarize when there are overworked. Allowing the students to turn in multiple, possibly incomplete drafts will give them structured criticism for their writing. It will help lead them in the right direction. Required conferences after the first draft will inspire growth in their writing. In the conferences, teachers can respond to their writing further establishing and strengthening their ownership of their writing voices. These practices may add many steps to ESL teaching, but leaving the students to their own devices in the new world, in the new culture, and the new rules in academia may only discourage the developing English learners.

Teachers can help support academic integrity and help students to understand all aspects of academic dishonesty by focusing their attention on the syllabus. For Abukhattala (2012) the “course outline” should incorporate a discussion on plagiarism. Talking to the students about the school policies and explaining to them the possible consequences will not prevent the underlining reasons for their plagiarizing, but it will help the students understand the importance of academic honesty in American universities. They must be taught what not to do. Allowing students to know that teachers care about the students’ personal work may influence them to write their own papers.

When focusing on the different cultural perspectives of academic integrity and behaviors of the students, ESL teachers should be careful not to stereotype the students. Sowden says, “[...] both teachers and students need to be aware of cultural differences in the academic context and to respond in a way which respects the integrity of the different traditions” (2005). Respecting the students’ cultural differences, when the topic is plagiarism, includes not assuming a student will plagiarize because he or she is from a certain culture. Teachers must face each act of plagiarism individually. Hopefully,

teaching the students about plagiarism on the first day of school will keep them motivated to do their own work. However, Liu (2005) says, "[...] those who plagiarize in China, like those who do it in the West, know that what they are doing is wrong and they do it anyway as an easy way to obtain personal gains." It may be that teaching the students about the wrongs of plagiarizing will only benefit students who morally believe in academic integrity and are themselves, regardless of their culture, academically honest. The teacher must balance having an understanding of many cultures as well as understanding each student individually. During the day that ESL teachers explain to their students what academic integrity means, the teacher must allow the students to explain how their "previous educational background" taught them to write and reference other writers. Developing communication between the students and the teacher will keep stereotypes from unfolding and be another source of motivation for the students.

While the American university writing programs focuses on the individual, other parts of the world especially the Middle East and the Far East are more focused on the group and how the individual affects the group. Considering the collectivistic approach to academics, we may find a reason for many ESL students copying each other's work at home. Since Rubenstein (2006) says, "Solidarity, harmony, and equal distribution of rewards among peers are prized," we can infer that some ESL students believe that a good grade can be shared. A common practice of students is finding out who has taken the class before. Once they have found a person with the same homework from the same class, they ask for pictures of this homework so that they may copy the draft. It could be that the pressure to learn English and the pressure to score high are dimmed by the knowledge that someone else has the composition already written. Because the latter is a

part of the same group, from the same country, he or she may feel obliged to share the document in order to affect the group in a positive way.

The literature, whether it is for native English-speaking students or ESL students, acknowledges a problem within the classroom when it comes to teaching students about academic integrity. The students react to their environment in terms of how they are taught to perceive plagiarism. If they are taught extensively about plagiarism and how to prevent it, then they are more likely to internalize the negative connotations of plagiarism. Culture may be a part of the argument and perhaps some perspectives of the students'; however, if we were to combine Abukhattala's (2012) findings and Power's (2009) themes into one student, be them native or international, the possibilities of confusion within the student are endless. What we want to do is give back “agency” (Power, 2009) to the students and help discover their true writing abilities. The Internet websites that offer to write their papers for them do not help to become comfortable with the truth in their own words. The institutional (Lyon, 2009) feeling that accompanies academic writing can be numbed by the students who have used their lessons in academic writing as a way to show their credibility and their own opinions of the world. To do so, they will need to find a love of ownership for their own words.

“Externalization” (Power, 2009) in an ESL context illustrates the emotions that the ESL students may have towards plagiarism. Much like the American students in Power's (2009) research, plagiarism may be an alien concept that must be defined, examined, studied, and prevented in writing several times within the classroom before it can be internalized. However, even if the prevention of plagiarism becomes ingrained within students' academic discourse, it may never be accepted as a moral by students.

### **Ingeborg's Rough Draft**

How do we describe unintentional plagiarism? We know that the student, Ingeborg, is honest and that none of the so-called plagiarism is intentional, so why is it happening?

### **Causes of Unintentional Plagiarism**

The following conclusions were drawn by the researcher and her mentor—also the instructor of the students in the case study.

- Haste: The student was writing quickly within a 50-minute session in class.
- Setting: This was an in-class assignment.
- Availability of texts: Students were given written texts to use during the assignment such as the copies of song lyrics, essay prompts.
- An assumption on the part of the writer: The student knows that the teacher knows. The teacher knows who wrote the song. The teacher is not a distant audience.
- Subtly: Teacher's ideas appear in the essay without credit given.

Does the student have to quote?

- Earlier that week, the students watched the video, listened to the song, and listened to the story related to the song. Dr. Reeves gave a copy of the song to the students. Students answered comprehension questions about the song, the story-tellers experiences, the Great Depression, and the Hobos' lives on the rail.

- Do we have to quote when the story-teller, who will be singing the song on the video, tells his story related to the song?
- Possible logic of Ingeborg and Other Students: *I'm not putting Dr. Reeves in quotes. She's my reader and evaluator, and she knows what she said in her lesson.*
- Common Knowledge: The student might believe that all Americans know about the history of hobos. The student might also believe that his/her classmates will write the same information, because they have been a part of the same lesson.
- Genre: This essay is a kind of test to find out if we understand the song and lecture. We repeat what we have learned to show we understand the lesson. This rough draft is an expository instructional essay. It is exposition and interpretive, not evaluation.
- Purpose: The purpose of the essay is to demonstrate comprehension of three parts of a lesson that lasted all week. The purpose is evaluation of the students' learning, specifically, the learning of vocabulary taught in the pre-writing activities: *The marked houses and the hobos. How did they know they could get food? What is the message of the song?* The lesson will evaluate the students' writing fluency. They have to count their words and write the number at the end of the essay. The primary motivation is to complete the task of writing 500 words in 45 minutes.

- Urgency: The students are not thinking about MLA. They are thinking about the directions in the essay prompt that do not say to quote the author's words.
- Tasks: What is the story? Can you retell the story accurately?
- Interpretive: What is the message of the story? What are we to learn from it? Reflection is required during this task. Are we quoting when reflecting? The essay is a culminating activity at the end of the week-long lesson. In this activity, mechanics and MLA style are not graded.
- Brainstorming: This is a very rough draft. The student is trying to find meaning from the lesson. There is a lot to attend to in this writing activity. In the learners' minds, there is a hierarchy of tasks.
- Metacognitive awareness – The case study's student is very high. She is very aware during this first in-class essay.
- Inexperience: The student is asked to write on the spot with no advance knowledge of the topic, and students do not have this custom in their home countries for the most part.

Writing teachers should analyze the setting, the prompt, the genre, and the instructions leading up to this in-class essay. In the draft stage, learners' past experience is used for writing on demand. The students' writing cultures influence their writing on demand experience. For example, Albalawi (2014) described the kind of writing he did as an English major in Saudi Arabia, stating that before the essay exam given in class, he was told to memorize a section of a book, a poem, an essay, or a speech by Shakespeare, and what he had to do during the test was

simply to write this out from memory without interpreting the text or evaluating the effectiveness of the piece. For many cultures, in-class writing does not mean you write any of your own ideas. In fact, students are usually told that none of their opinions should appear. Interpretation is not wanted, because the experts have written books on Shakespeare. The job of the student is to repeat what the experts say and try to do it verbatim. Should the students put the whole exam in quotes? Is it any wonder that teachers might get this kind of writing from the students who share this academic culture?

### **The Second Draft**

If all of this is true, why do we still not see any quotes in the next drafts? The students were asked to revise the essay at home.

- They perhaps have not been taught MLA style.
- Maybe they have been taught it, but they don't know how important it is.
- By the second draft, the first out-of-class revision, the primary goal may be to improve the essay content.
  - Between the Rough Draft and the Second Draft, a lesson was taught on how to revise essays. The instructor continued to focus on meaning and interpretation, not mechanics and not MLA style.

Many contemporary composition experts who have the doctoral degree in composition and/or rhetoric believe—as the instructor does—that ideas are at the center of any piece of writing. So they may either directly or indirectly convey

that message in their teaching. Students may intuitively continue to focus on ideas in their drafting stages.

The students were told that they would be graded on fluency, accuracy, interpretation, and reflection in the Rough Draft. In fact, they were told not to waste any time on spelling or punctuation or grammar decisions in class while writing the Rough Draft. Naturally, this feeling that ideas were the most important transferred into the next draft.



## Chapter 5

### Conclusion

Chapter 5 includes (1) a summary of the findings; (2) tentative answers to the research questions; (3) limitations of the present study; (4) implications for teaching—the primary objective of action research; (5) recommendations for future research; and (6) final reflections from the researcher and instructor of record in the classroom where the student writing was collected for this thesis.

### Summary of the Research Process and the Findings

Action research by its very nature involves an “iterative” process as suggested in TESOL’s guidelines for qualitative research, and this revisiting of the data takes time and patience because it is a “**process** for arriving at a decision or a desired result by repeating rounds of analysis or a cycle of operations. The objective is to bring the desired decision or result closer to discovery with each repetition (**iteration**)” ([www.businessdictionary.com/definition/iterative-process.html](http://www.businessdictionary.com/definition/iterative-process.html)). For me, as the primary investigator, and for my thesis advisor—who was also the instructor of record, the data analysis and the discussions spanned an entire academic year because we were finding patterns of plagiarism in the students’ writing that were different and unexpected patterns of unintentional plagiarism. We were looking for the “unseen, unheard, and unexpected” (Greene cited in Josius, 2016, p. 16) in our five writers’ drafts of a total of 15 essays in the final form. In the middle of the initial data analysis, we discovered a new kind of citation problem—patch writing—and another

plagiarism that can be caused by the effects of cryptomnesia experienced by Helen Keller, who inadvertently “wrote” a story, “The Frost King,” that had been told to her as a child through home sign done in the palm of Helen’s hand. Helen had no memories of being told the story that she had recreated and written for a friend three years later, finally appearing in a magazine. Though we found no definite examples of this kind of unintentional plagiarism in our five writers’ work, we became more sensitive to the word-for-word copying that students did when they had heard it from a video. This lead us to think that maybe the spoken word is different in multilingual writers’ minds and does not quite fit into their concept of plagiarism. In the end, however, we were able to see patterns that we had not been even looking for initially because we continued to return to the student essays to gain more insight about their writing processes—the environment in the classroom during the rough drafting and the conditions under which they revised near the end of the quarter.

### **Tentative Answers to the Research Questions**

#### **Research Question 1.**

In what ways do ESL students plagiarize—both intentionally and unintentionally—if they do at all, when they write for academic purposes?

Because we did not find any intentional plagiarism, this part of the question remains unanswered but could be explored in future research. We did, however, identify some unintentional plagiarism, and through an iterative process, we concluded that this was caused mostly from a lack of knowing how to cite—

particularly video—correctly. We saw this in Lorde's writing in which she was analyzing the meanings of lyrics in two different essays: "Hobo's Lullaby" about the Great Depression and "The Green Fields of France" about WWI. She seemed to be putting a line from the lyrics without citing the source but immediately reiterating and interpreting the meaning with rhetorical purpose, assuming that all peers reader and instructors would know the source since they were present when the video was shown.

### **Research Question 2.**

#### What are some cultural perceptions of plagiarism?

This question is answered in detail in Chapter 3, so in summary, the perceptions varied considerably prior to MLA instruction given by the researcher in class, but the most relevant ones follow:

1) More than half of the students (n=11) thought it was wrong to use somebody else's words without giving credit to the author. Two of the students thought it was acceptable to copy without giving credit. Unfortunately, however, eight students misunderstood the question.

2) Ming-Hua from China, however, insisted that "nobody owns an idea" and this gave us food for thought. It was also Ingeborg's teacher's requirement that writers had to simply list references at the end of a paper and not indicate who said what, where, and when. We could not determine what form the actual paper took. Was it to be nothing but the student's words and not original authors' words? Did the teacher assume that nothing is ever original?

### **Research Question 3.**

What can teachers do to help ESL students understand and avoid plagiarism?

We can continue to review MLA citation for various genres—a poem, an article, a film, a song. In addition, we can provide weekly practice with paraphrasing because they are already carrying a heavy cognitive load—as language learners—and it is easy to forget when and how to cite others’ words and ideas. Further, this kind of practice helps them understand the text and increase English proficiency, especially with vocabulary—synonyms and antonyms. At the same time, we can

1) offer set phrases to show how to paraphrase within the essay itself to increase the cohesion of the paper—“in other words” or “the author argues...” and

2) suggest ways to re-order the information at the sentence level to help student writers learn a new technique that moves beyond patchwriting—which is usually considered plagiarism as documented when a journalist was fired from *The Spectator* for patchwriting from an article in *The New York Times* (McBride, 2012, web) .

## **Limitations of the Present Study**

### **The questionnaire**

Question 3 in the questionnaire was misunderstood by eight of 15 students, so this question about where it is ever okay to copy other people's words and ideas needs to be simplified and clarified.

If the survey is used again, we would add a sentence from the biography they are reading to see how they paraphrase before and after instruction in MLA citation.

### **Follow-up interviews**

If time had permitted, we would have conducted interviews with each of the four writers to show them parts of their papers that should have had citations and ask them why they did not use quotes. Feedback and student assessment of their own work are important parts that could be included—beyond the grading that the papers received from the instructor.

## **Implications for Teaching & Recommendations**

Materials with models to be developed include

- i) practice activities for paraphrasing—like short, weekly activities that helps them apply MLA citation rules.
- ii) sample writings in which students decide if any part is plagiarized and why and how.
- iii) peer journals that students have to paraphrase or cite in a short paper written in class the same day to experience somebody else using their words and taking credit for their ideas; and

iv) reading of a short newspaper article which students must summarize and include one direct and one paraphrase to see if they are able to apply the rules in this way.

### **Future Research that is needed**

We recommend that conferences with the students be recorded following this protocol:

- 1) Students bring in two copies of the rough draft;
- 2) Students read the whole essay aloud to the intern or instructor without interruption;
- 3) Instructor reflects back to the student what the paper is about.
- 4) Students read the paper aloud one more time
  - a) Stopping to identify and color code with markers
    - i) Paraphrases
    - ii) Direct quotes, and
    - iii) Summaries of sources listed in Works Cited
- 5) Teacher would have the student stop each time one of the above is identified and discuss why the student has labeled it in this way while providing corrective feedback before the student color codes this phrase or sentence.
- 6) This intensive conferencing will help students see that even single words have to be put in quotes in MLA style—with the author and the page number. If, in fact, the instructor agrees that it is only a paraphrase, the instructor can remind the student that even paraphrases have to have a page number, even in cases where none of the author's words have been used.

### **Researcher's Final Reflections**

The most valuable information I have gleaned from this project is that learning how to use another person's words is often a reflection of language proficiency and cultural understanding. Paraphrasing is also a part of the process of language learning because it requires two major cognitive abilities: comprehending the text and having adequate academic vocabulary to capture the original meaning in other words.

The most unexpected discovery I made was that the students who are highly proficient have a harder time paraphrasing than those of lower proficiency. This is a phenomenon we see as students are becoming more fluent and advanced in English—possibly because they are becoming more and more aware of all the intricacies of writing—all of the choices, all of the nuances, all of the challenges of conveying the original meaning in a foreign language. Even the best students, like Ingeborg, who have high standards struggle with citing correctly, unknowingly plagiarize for a variety of reasons discussed elsewhere in this thesis.

I have recently encountered the same phenomenon with my current students. To prepare them for a research presentation, I gave them a worksheet with quotes from articles they were using to gather information for their projects. The quotes were of a higher English level so they were quite difficult for the students to not only paraphrase but also to understand. I was surprised to find that the lower students were able to capture the meaning of the sentences and put them into simpler sentences and in their own words. The students considered to be of a higher level of English proficiency had a more difficult time with the assignment.

They hardly put the sentences into their own words but chose instead to rearrange the sentence clauses, phrases, and words. Again, I believe that this is a sign that the students have too much on their mind, so to speak. They are aware of all the things that go into conveying a message in another language that they have become somewhat blocked. Right now, the only suggestion that I have for them is more practice. I anticipate that, because this phenomenon may be a part of the language learning process, the students who are considered lower in their English proficiency will one day have the same struggles with paraphrasing. However, if they continue to practice, they might be able to bypass this area of struggle. It is a possibility that had the higher students been given ample chances to practice paraphrasing that their current struggle might too have been bypassed.



## References

- Abukhattala, I. (2012) Plagiarism and Culture: Are They Closely Related To Each Other? DOI: 10.7763/IPEDR. 2012. V54. 28
- Albalawi, S. (2014). Using Media to Teach Grammar in Context and UNESCO Values: A Case Study of Two English Teachers and Students from Saudi Arabia.. *EWU Masters Thesis Collection*. Paper 258. <http://dc.ewu.edu/theses/258>
- Alzahrani, S. M., Naomie, S., Abraham, A. (2012) Understanding Plagiarism linguistic patterns, textual features, and detection methods. *IEEE Transactions on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics*. 42(2). 133-146.
- Anson, C. M. (2011). Fraudulent Practices: Academic Misrepresentations of Plagiarism In the Name of Good Pedagogy. *Composition Studies*, 39(2). 29-43.
- CCCC (2015). Conference on College Composition and Communication. Writing Assessment Position Statement. July, 2015, web.
- Celce-Murcia, M., Brinton, D. M., Snow, M. (2014). *Teaching English as a Second and Foreign Language*. Heinle Cengage Learning. 4<sup>th</sup> Edition.
- Chatterjee, M. (2007). Learning to Avoid Plagiarism: Narratives of three International Students from Language Backgrounds other than English. *International Journal of Learning*. 13(10). 87-94.
- Chien, S. (2014). Cultural Constructions of Plagiarism in Student Writing: Teachers' Perceptions and Responses. *Research in the Teaching of English*, 49(2).120-140.

- Elander, J., Pittam, G., Lusher, J., Fox, P., Payne, N., (2010). Evaluation of an intervention to help students avoid unintentional plagiarism by improving their authorial identity. *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education*. 35(2). 157–171
- Ellery, K. (2008a). An investigation into electronic-source plagiarism in a first-year essay assignment. *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education*, 33(6). 607–617.
- Ellery, K. (2008b). Undergraduate plagiarism: a pedagogical perspective. *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education*, 33(5). 507–516.
- Gallant, T. B. (2007). The complexity of integrity culture change: A case study of a liberal arts college. *The Review of Higher Education*. 30(4). 391-411.
- Gillespie, G. M. (2012). Guide to Advising International Students about Academic Integrity. *The Mentor: An Academic Advising Journal*. (July, 2015, web).
- Gourlay, L. and Deane, J. (2002). Loss, responsibility, blame? Staff discourses of student plagiarism. *Innovations in Education and Teaching International*. 49(1). 19-29.
- Handa, N. and Power, C. (2005). Land and Discover! A Case Study Investigating the Cultural Context of Plagiarism, *Journal of University Teaching & Learning Practice*, 2(3).
- hooks, bell (1989) Choosing the Margin as a Space for Radical Openness. *Yearnings: Race, Gender and Cultural Politics*. 203-209.

- Hu, G. and Lei, J. (2012). Investigating Chinese University Students' Knowledge of and Attitudes toward plagiarism from an integrated perspective. *Language Learning: A Journal of Research in Language Studies*. 62(3). 813-850.
- Howard, R. (1995). Plagiarisms, Authorships, and the Academic Death Penalty. *College English*. 57(7). 788-806.
- Howard, R. (2000). Sexuality, Textuality: The Cultural Work of Plagiarism. *College English*. 62(4). 473-491.
- Jager, K. and Brown, C. (2010). The tangles web: investigating academics' view of plagiarism at the university of Cape Town. *Studies in Higher Education*. 35(5). 513-528.
- Karbalaee, A. and Amoli, F.A. (2011). The Effect of paraphrasing strategy training on the reading comprehension of college students at the undergraduate level. *Asian EFL Journal*, 13(3), 229-245.
- Kiriakidis, P. (2012). Mandatory Use of TurnItIn: The Effect of a Policy on Reducing Unoriginal Writing in Online Classes. *Postmodern Openings*. 3(1). 81-105.
- Kolln, M., Gray, L., Salvatore, J. (2016). *Understanding English Grammar*. Pearson. 10<sup>th</sup> Edition.
- Kwong et al. Students' and faculty's perception of academic integrity in Hong Kong. *Emerald in Sight*. 27(5). 341-355.

- Lacey, Peter M., (2013). Poetry in translation to teach ESL composition at the college level. EWU Masters Thesis Collection. Paper 88.  
<http://dc.ewu.edu/theses/88>
- Lo, S. (1996). *Cultural Influences and Issues for Taiwanese Students Learning English as a Foreign Language*. EWU Masters Thesis Collection.
- Lui, D. (2005). Plagiarism in ESOL students: is cultural conditioning truly the major culprit? *ELT Journal Volume 59/3* July 2005;  
doi:10.1093/elt/cci043
- Lyon, A. (2009) "You Fail": Plagiarism, the Ownership of Writing, and Transnational Conflicts. *College Composition and Communication*. 61(2). 222-239.
- McBride, K. (2012). 'Patchwriting' is more common than plagiarism, just as dishonest. Poynter.org (web) Sept. 18.
- McCabe et al. (2008). Academic Dishonesty in the Middle East: Individual and Contextual Factors. *Research in Higher Education*, 49. 451-467.
- NCTE (2005). National Council of Teachers of English. Position Statement on Multimodal Literacies. July, 2015, web.
- Pennycook, A. (1996). Borrowing Others' Words: Text, Ownership, Memory, and Plagiarism. *TESOL Quarterly*, Vol. 30, No. 2 pp. 201-230.
- Pittam, G., Elander, J., Lusher, J., Fox, P., Payne, N. (2009). Student Beliefs and Attitudes about authorial identity in academic writing. *Studies in Higher Education*, 34(2). 153-170.
- Power, L. (2009). University Students' Perceptions of Plagiarism. *The Journal of Higher Education*. 80(6). 643-662.

- Reyman, J. (2008). Rethinking plagiarism for technical communication. *Technical Communication*, Vol. 55(1). 61-67.
- Rubenstein, I. (2006). Educational Expectations: how they differ Around the world: implications for teaching ESL college students. *Community College Journal of Research and Practice*. 30. 433–441,
- Sacks, Oliver. (2013) Speak, Memory. *The New York Review of Books*.
- Sowden, C. (2005). Plagiarism and the culture of multilingual students in higher education abroad. *ELT Journal* 59(3); doi:10.1093/elt/cci042
- Sun, Y. (2012). Does Text Readability Matter? A Study of Paraphrasing and Plagiarism in English as a Foreign Language Writing Context. *The Asia-Pacific Education Researcher*. 21(2). 296-306.
- Sutherland-Smith, W. (2010) Retribution, deterrence and reform: the dilemmas of plagiarism management in universities. *Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management*, 32(1). 5–16.
- Tompkins, G. E. (2013). *Language Arts: Patterns of Practice*. Boston: Pearson.
- Thompson, L. C., Williams, P. G. (1995). But I Changed Three Words! Plagiarism in the ESL Classroom. *The Clearing House*, 69(1). 27-29.
- Writemypapers.org. July, 2015, web.

## APPENDIX A

### English Language Learners' Intentional and Unintentional Plagiarism: Action Research in College Composition

#### Consent Form

You are being asked to participate in a research project conducted by:

<b>Principal Investigator</b> Jacqueline Gullon, Master of Arts in English/TESL Student PO Box 454 Cheney, WA 99004 208-398-0724 E-mail: <a href="mailto:jdlightfoot@eagles.ewu.edu">jdlightfoot@eagles.ewu.edu</a>	<b>Responsible Project Investigator</b> Dr. LaVona Reeves, MA-TESL Program Director, English Department 158A Reid School Tel: (509) 359-7060 E-mail: <a href="mailto:lreeves@mail.ewu.edu">lreeves@mail.ewu.edu</a>
---	---

**Purpose and Benefits:** The purpose of this study is to describe the challenges that ESL writers face at the college level when citing sources correctly to avoid plagiarism in their compositions.

**Procedures:** I am asking you to allow me to include (in my master's thesis) selections (quotations) from your journals, essays, questionnaires, and quizzes from English 112. Dr. Reeves and I will analyze your assignments for common themes. I will assign you a random number or a random name, and your real **name will not appear** in the thesis. This project fulfills requirements for the Master of Arts in English with an emphasis in Teaching English as a Second Language.

**Risk, Stress or Discomfort:** The risks of participating in this study are not expected to exceed those encountered in daily life. Your writing will appear in the thesis only with your written permission. Your name will be confidential. Only Dr. Reeves & I will know your name, and it will not appear in the thesis. Though the journals, essays, questionnaires, and quizzes are required for those enrolled in English, you will not be required to submit your work to me for my thesis if you choose not to participate in my thesis project. It is totally voluntary. Your decision not to participate in this study will in no way affect your grade in English 112.

**Other Information:** Participation in this study is completely voluntary. You may stop participating at any time without penalty. The writing I collect for the thesis will be kept confidential. Your name will not be used in the thesis, but I will give each participant a different name or random number, so readers cannot know your real name.

If you have any concerns about your rights as a participant in this research or any complaints you wish to make, you may contact Ruth Galm, Human Protections Administrator at Eastern Washington University (509-359-7971/6567) <[rgalm@ewu.edu](mailto:rgalm@ewu.edu)>.

Please return the signed form only if you are participating.

Jacqueline Gullon

Primary Investigator's name

Primary Investigator's signature

Date

Yes, I will participate.

The study described above has been explained to me, and I voluntarily consent to participate in this study. I have had an opportunity to ask questions. I am not waiving any of my legal rights by signing this form. I understand I will receive a copy of this consent form after I sign it.

Student's name printed in English

Student's signature

Date

Yes, Jacqueline Gullon has my permission to reproduce selections of my coursework including journals, essays, questionnaires, and quizzes from English 112 in her thesis without identifying me.

Student's name printed in English

Student's signature

Date

112 2014 Essay 1 Hobo's Lullaby

Name\_\_\_\_\_date\_\_\_\_\_Word count\_\_\_\_\_

Purpose

1. To provide information about The Great Depression for readers who know little or nothing about American history
2. To define hobo and explain the life of the hobo
3. To retell the story the lady told the singer at one of his concerts for readers who have not heard the story before
4. To summarize and quote from the song for readers who have not heard the song yet.
5. To analyze the message of the story the singer told before he sang the song
  - a. To explain why this song should be taught when studying the Great Depression
  - b. To suggest how important the relationship between the girl and the hobo was, though they met for just one day on a back porch

Genre

- Exposition—to teach your readers
- Narration—to retell a story
- Analysis—to analyze the song and story
- Argumentation—to argue that this is an important story that must be told

Length

- 500 words
- five paragraphs

Format—structure of your essay—you must have the following paragraphs with this information in each one. Everyone will have the same thesis at the end of paragraph 1 and the same topic sentences at the beginning of paragraphs 2-5. Copy.

1. Introduction
  - a. provide information about The Great Depression for readers who know little or nothing about American history
  - b. write this thesis statement:
    - i. The purpose of this essay is (1) to introduce the life of the hobos in the Great Depression, (2)to tell a story of one hobo who changed a girl's life forever, and (3) to analyze the song, "Hobo's Lullaby."
    - ii. Be sure to mention the name of the man on the video who told the story and the song that you will be analyzing

2. First, I will define hobo and explain the life of the hobo during this period of American history.

- a. —
- b. --

3. Next, I will retell the story the lady told the singer, Mr. Bill....., at one of his concerts and that he shared on his YouTube video we watched in our composition class this quarter.

- a. Summarize and quote from the song for readers who have not heard the song yet.
- b. Be sure to tell what the songwriter's attitude it toward the hobo he is singing to.

4. Next, I will analyze the message of the story the singer told before he sang the song.

- a. Explain why this song should be taught when studying the Great Depression
- b. Analyze how important the relationship between the girl and the hobo was, though they met for just one day on a back porch.

5. Finally, I will suggest a hidden message that the story might tell and tell the most important lesson I learned from this lesson taught by Dr. Reeves.

Evaluation 20 points each: (spelling, grammar, and mechanics are not graded on the rough draft).

- Completeness—had all five paragraphs & included what was required & write 500 words
- Organization—organized in the way asked with thesis statement and topic sentences
- Development—gave examples from the story and the poem
- Focus & expression—stayed on topic used appropriate words and quotes to help the reader understand
- Knowledge & understanding of the story and poem—showed clear and exact understanding

Total score \_\_\_\_\_

Pre-viewing Questions to listen for in the video. Answer these as you watch the video and listen to the story and song.

- 1. Who is the storyteller?
- 2. What state was he in when someone told him a story about hobos?
- 3. What is a hobo?
- 4. How did hobos travel in this period of American history?

Why?

- 5. What years are we talking about? What era of American history do we call this?
- 6. What was “marked by the hobos”? Why?



7. What words describe the lady's mother?
  8. Who became President in 1932?
  9. How long was he President of the United States?
- Years?
10. How did he and Eleanor feel toward the poor? Why?
  11. "There would come a \_\_\_\_\_ at the door." Where?
  12. How did the girl's family compare to the other families of the time?
  13. How do we know?
  14. How did her mother help the hobos?
  15. Did people fear hobos in those days?
  16. Why or why not?
  17. What did the girl call "stupid stuff"?
  18. What grade was the girl in at the time?
  19. What author was she supposed to read that day?
  20. How did the hobo her the girl?
  21. How long did they spend on the homework together?
  22. How did her life change forever?
  23. What job did the girl end up with?
  24. It turned out that that old hobo on the back porch had been what?
  - a. Why do we need to know this?
  - b. How did the girl benefit from the afternoon with that hobo?
  25. What light did he spark in that young girl?
  26. What made the woman hear that reminded her of this event in her life?
  27. Why did she tell the "troubadour"?
  28. How does the girl/woman honor her mother?
  29. How does she honor the hobo?
  30. What is the meaning of good fortune?
  - a. What is the opposite?
  - b. In what way did the girl have good fortune?
  - c. The hobo?
  31. What kind of homework did you have a hard time with?
  32. Who helped you?
  33. How?
  34. Whom have you helped? With what?
  35. What song does the storyteller sing?
  36. What function does the story serve in this video?
  37. Whom is the song addressing?
  38. What is the main message of the song?
  39. Where does the hobo sleep in the song? Why?
  40. How old is the hobo? What clues are there?
  41. What should the hobo just "smile" at? Why?

42. What will the hobo find someday?                      Where?
43. What religion might the songwriter be?                      How do we know?
44. When a singer does not sing the words but just throws the voice, what do we call that?
- a. What kind of music do we hear this in?
- b. Do you have that in your country too?

Hobo's \_\_\_\_\_  
By Goebel Reeves

**Chorus**

1. Go to sleep you weary \_\_\_\_\_
2. Let the \_\_\_\_\_ drift slowly by
3. Can't you hear the steel \_\_\_\_\_ humming?
4. That's a hobo's lullaby
5. Do not think about \_\_\_\_\_
6. Let tomorrow come and go
7. Tonight you're in a nice warm \_\_\_\_\_
8. Safe from all the wind and \_\_\_\_\_

**Chorus**

9. I know the \_\_\_\_\_ cause you trouble.
10. They cause \_\_\_\_\_ everywhere.
11. But when you die and go to \_\_\_\_\_,
12. There won't be no \_\_\_\_\_ there.

**Chorus**

13. I know your \_\_\_\_\_ are torn and ragged
14. And your \_\_\_\_\_ is turning grey
15. Lift your head and smile at \_\_\_\_\_
16. You'll find \_\_\_\_\_ someday

Journal: Hobo's Lullaby (100+ words) Word  
count \_\_\_\_\_

Write a summary of the message of the song.

Choose a line from the song and connect it to your own life or your country's history.

## 112 2012 Essay 5 Triangle Factory Fire

Name\_\_\_\_\_date\_\_\_\_\_

You may not use any notes, dictionaries, books, i-phones, or any handouts of any kind.

### **Genre**

Exposition—you are teaching the readers about the historical event.

**Purpose & Format**—for each number below, write a paragraph that gives all the information from the documentary and reading we did this week. You will have five paragraphs minimum, but if you want to add other paragraphs, that is acceptable, too.

1. To describe the fire—Introduction—brief summary. Expand in later paragraphs.
  - a. Write the topic sentence & include just basic information:
    - i. What actually happened? Summarize briefly and expand later in the essay.
    - ii. Who was involved in the fire? Information about the workers.
    - iii. When did it happen? Date? Time?
    - iv. Where did it happen? City? Part of city? Exact building?
    - v. Why did this tragedy happen? Lack of safety coded in the building—to be explained in detail in a later paragraph.
  - b. Thesis statement
    - i. The purpose of this essay is (1) to tell the story of the fire, (2) to explain labor conditions of the early 1900s in the United States, (3) to describe labor reforms that resulted, and (4) to detail the project that was started by one of the owner's granddaughters to honor the dead workers.
    - ii. Your remaining paragraphs will go in the order stated in the thesis statement.

**2. First, I will tell the story of the fire on that Friday afternoon more than 100 years ago.**

**3. Next, I will explain labor conditions of the early 1900s in the United States, particularly the conditions in the Triangle Factory that lead to the death of almost one third of the workers that afternoon. Include this quote:** According the United States Department of Labor, “The high proportion of uneducated, non-English speaking immigrants working in [factories]” and there was “little attempt to teach them about the dangers on their jobs and few warning signs” (accessed 4 May 2012 web). Describe the situation in the factory that day in March when they died.

**4. Next, I explain how the women are being remembered every year at the factory building.**

- i. Explain Hirsch's project to find living relatives of the women who died.
  1. Mention the gravestones

2. Mention the fading of the names
3. Mention that every year there is a memorial service in front of the building where the factory used to be.
  - a. They ring a bell 146 times every year—why?
  - b. Why must we remember the deceased workers?
  - c. NYC school children go to the factory and what do they hear and see?
  - d. Why do teachers take them there every year?

### **Audience**

#### **5. Finally, I will introduce the memorial project that was started by one of the owner's granddaughters to honor the dead workers.**

- a. Her name was Susan Harris. Tell her story—about how the family moved after the owners were “acquitted” by a jury. Public “outrage” was in NYC on that day. Explain why.
- b. The fire was a family secret.
- c. Harris started a project
  - i. Describe what she did and why
  - ii. Explain why the workers should not be forgotten.
 

U.S. high school students who have no background in labor law or labor history

### **Evaluation +=yes -=no N=needs your attention—needs work**

- Counted words—500 words minimum, including thesis statement, topic sentences, and quotes
- showed that you knew the material in the video, the reading, the vocabulary
- presented accurate facts with names: Michael Hirsch, Michelle Miller, Frances Perkins, Celia Giltin, Erica Lansner, Fannie Lansner, Elizabeth Wilson (Great niece of Joseph who died), Rosie Solomon (fiancée of Joseph), Essie Bernstein, Max Blancke (Grandfather of Susan Harris); Isaac Harris followed the format—intro, body, conclusion
- included thesis statement
- included topic sentence for each paragraph
- used the quotes required
- used at least 10 vocabulary words correctly, underlined words, & numbered them
- answered all questions
- used transitions to show connections among ideas and information
- kept focus in the paragraphs

- stuff,
- wrote in an academic voice—no conversational words—get, thing,
  - completed the essay
  - developed the essay by example and facts
  - wrote for the audience
  - understood the purpose of the essay

**Vocabulary—use 10 correctly in your essay. Underline each. Number each. You may write others for extra credit—but number them as well—11, 12, 13, etc. Up to 20 for extra credit.**

**Example:**

**1**

New York City was united in grief when so many poor, young immigrants women died needlessly.

## Curriculum Vitae

### Contact Information

---

Jacqueline D. Gullon  
220 Union St  
Cheney, WA 99004  
[jgullon53@ewu.edu](mailto:jgullon53@ewu.edu)

### Education

M.A.	TESOL, Eastern Washington University, Cheney, WA	2012 - 2016
B. A.	Creative Writing, Eastern Washington University, Cheney, WA.	2009 - 2011
A. A.	Spokane Falls Community College, Spokane, WA.	2004 - 2007

### Teaching Experience

#### Lecturer

Asia University America Program	
Eastern Washington University	
Integrated English Skills	March 2016 - July 2016
Functions	March 2016 - April 2016
Global Issues	April 2016 - July 2016
TOEIC	March 2016 - July 2016

#### Lecturer

Asia University America Program	
Eastern Washington University	
TOEIC	March 2015 - July 2015
Functions	March 2015 - April 2015
Global Issues	May 2015 - July 2015

#### Internship

Eastern Washington University	
Women's Literature and Social Change	2014
Composition for Multilingual Students	2012

#### Volunteer Work

Asia University America Program	
Eastern Washington University	
Integrated English Skills	2013 - 2014
Functions	2013

### Presentations

#### "Patchwriting, Storytelling, and Song: A Case Study"

Co-presenter with Dr. LaVona Reeves, Spokane Regional ESL Conference, Mukogawa Fort Wright Institute, February 28, 2015